

01/26/00

**Statement on the TJMF Research Committee Report
on Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings**

**Daniel P. Jordan, Ph.D., President
Thomas Jefferson Memorial Foundation, Inc.**

When the DNA study was released on the evening of October 31, 1998, the Thomas Jefferson Memorial Foundation (TJMF) responded immediately. Within twenty-four hours, we held a press conference with Dr. Eugene Foster (principal author of the study), posted a statement on our web site, and instructed our interpreters to initiate conversations with our visitors about the study. The Foundation also pledged that it would evaluate the scientific results -- and all other relevant evidence -- in a systematic and comprehensive way, and that we would, in the Jeffersonian tradition, "follow truth wherever it may lead."

Shortly thereafter, I appointed a staff research committee that included four Ph.D.'s (one with advanced study in genetics) and an M.D. The mandate was straightforward: (1) to gather and assess critically all relevant evidence about the relationship between Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings; (2) to consult with outside experts as well as with two long-standing TJMF advisory committees, comprised of scholars, public historians, and museum professionals who provide counsel for the Foundation's International Center for Jefferson Studies and about African-American interpretation at Monticello; and (3) to report its findings and recommendations to me in written form and in a timely manner. The committee, headed by Dr. Dianne Swann-Wright, responded in a manner that was scholarly, meticulous, and thorough. The committee's report is attached. I believe it represents the most extensive compilation ever of what is known and not known about this complex and consequential topic. It also reflects the Foundation's abiding belief in sharing serious research with the broadest possible audiences.

I concur with the committee's findings. Although paternity cannot be established with absolute certainty, our evaluation of the best evidence available suggests the strong likelihood that Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings had a relationship over time that led to the birth of one, and perhaps all, of the known children of Sally Hemings. We recognize that honorable people can disagree on this subject, as indeed they have for over two hundred years. Further, we know that the historical record has

gaps that perhaps can never be filled and mysteries that can never be fully resolved. Finally, we stand ready to review any fresh evidence at any time and to reassess our understanding of the matter in light of more complete information.

But for now, we will move forward to implement the findings of the research committee in a way that reflects the Foundation's ongoing commitment to scholarship. From the beginning, we have treated the Thomas Jefferson-Sally Hemings relationship as a research issue, and we will continue to do so. We believe it offers opportunities for the Thomas Jefferson Memorial Foundation, and that it will advance our firm belief in telling a story here that is accurate and honest -- and thus inclusive -- about Jefferson's remarkable life and legacy in the context of the complex and extraordinary plantation community that was Monticello.

**Report of the Research Committee
on Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings**
Thomas Jefferson Memorial Foundation
January 2000

I.	Committee Charge and Overview	Page 1
II.	Assessment of DNA Study	2
III.	Review of Documentary Sources	3
IV.	Research Findings and Implications	6
V.	Assessment of Possible Paternity of Other Jeffersons	9
VI.	Conclusions	10

Appendices

- A. Articles in the journal *Nature*:
 - Eugene A. Foster *et al.*, "Jefferson Fathered Slave's Last Child," November 5, 1998
 - Eric S. Lander and Joseph J. Ellis, "Founding Father," November 5, 1998
 - Eugene A. Foster *et al.*, letter to editor, January 7, 1999
- B. Views of scientists consulted:
 - Dr. Kenneth K. Kidd, Professor of Genetics, Yale University, January 1999
 - Dr. Mark Lovell, Director of the Molecular Biology Laboratory, University of Virginia School of Medicine, January 1999
 - Dr. David Page, Associate Director, Whitehead Institute, MIT Center for Genome Research, December 1998
 - Dr. Bruce Stillman, Director, Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory, February 1999
- C. Hemings and Jefferson family trees
- D. Foundation statement of November 1, 1998
- E. Relevant primary documents
- F. Review of primary documentary evidence
- G. Summary of oral history
- H. Compilation of documentary information on Sally Hemings and her children
- I. Statistical study of the relationship between Thomas Jefferson's presence at Monticello and Sally Hemings's conceptions
- J. Summary of research on the possible paternity of other Jeffersons
- K. Assessment of Thomas C. Woodson connection to Sally Hemings

I. Committee Charge and Overview

On December 21, 1998, Dr. Daniel P. Jordan, president of the Thomas Jefferson Memorial Foundation, appointed a research committee of Monticello staff members, including four Ph.D.'s and one medical doctor, and charged the committee with evaluating the DNA study of Dr. Eugene Foster and associates, assessing it within the context of all other relevant historical and scientific evidence, and recommending the impact it should have on historical interpretation at Monticello. The committee's members were:

Chair: Dianne Swann-Wright, Director of Special Programs

Whitney Espich, Communications Officer

Fraser Neiman, Director of Archaeology

Anne Porter, Education Instructor

David Ronka, Interpreter

Lucia Stanton, Shannon Senior Research Historian

Elizabeth Dowling Taylor, Head Guide

White McKenzie Wallenborn, Associate Interpreter

Camille Wells, Director of Research

The committee met as a whole ten times from December 1998 to April 1999, to discuss sources read by all members (see III) and reports by individual members on additional topics (issues of interpretation, media response, and the views of historians). Subcommittees on the scientific and documentary evidence were formed to gather and process information and consult with experts in the field. After preparation of a draft report, the committee consulted with members of Monticello's Advisory Committee for the International Center for Jefferson Studies and Advisory Committee on African-American Interpretation, and met in February 1999 with six individual members of these committees.

Minutes from the committee meetings are in the files of the Chair, Dianne Swann-Wright.

II. Assessment of DNA Study

The committee believes the design and methodology of the DNA analysis reported by Dr. Eugene Foster *et al.* in the journal *Nature* is sound and straightforward and meets the current standards of the scientific community. The laboratories involved are highly reputable in Y-chromosomal studies and have extensive records of publication in scientific peer-reviewed journals. The study compared nineteen genetic markers on the Y chromosomes of fourteen subjects—five male-line descendants of two sons of Field Jefferson (Thomas Jefferson’s paternal uncle), three male-line descendants of three sons of John Carr (grandfather of Samuel and Peter Carr), five male-line descendants of two sons of Thomas Woodson, and one male-line descendant of Eston Hemings.

The results clearly show that the male-line descendants of Field Jefferson and Eston Hemings have identical Y-chromosome haplotypes (the particular combination of variants at defined loci on the chromosome). Scientists note that there is less than a 1 percent probability that this is due to chance. Thus the haplotype match is over one hundred times more likely when Jefferson and Eston Hemings are genetically related through the male line. This study by itself does not establish that Hemings’s father was Thomas Jefferson, only that Hemings’s father was *a* Jefferson.

Because of the absence of a match between the Carr and Hemings haplotypes, the study rules out both Samuel and Peter Carr as Eston Hemings’s father. Since the Jefferson and Woodson haplotypes also did not match, the study indicates that Thomas Woodson’s father was not a Jefferson. We note that the design of the study eliminates any ambiguity resulting from the genetic influence of John Wayles, Thomas Jefferson’s father-in-law and Sally Hemings’s alleged father, by looking at markers only on the Y chromosome. DNA of male-line descendants of five “old Virginia families” was also included in the analysis in an attempt to sample the local population of Y chromosomes. None matched the Jefferson haplotype, one that is considered quite rare.

The committee is aware that further DNA testing, coordinated by Dr. Foster, is in progress.

For comments of scientists consulted, see Appendix B.

III. Review of Documentary Sources

All members of the committee read or reread relevant primary documents and secondary works, including those listed below, plus a compilation of the most pertinent statements about the issue (Appendix F) by over a dozen of Jefferson's contemporaries.

Primary Sources (see Appendix E):

- 1802** James Thomson Callender, extracts of articles in *Richmond Recorder*, September through December
- 1805** Jefferson cover letter to Secretary of the Navy Robert Smith, July 1, 1805, Missouri Historical Society; also printed in *Thomas Jefferson Correspondence*, ed. Worthington C. Ford (Boston, 1916), pages 114-115
- 1850s** Extracts of journal of John Hartwell Cocke, January 26, 1853, and April 23, 1859, University of Virginia Library
- 1858** Letter of Jefferson's granddaughter Ellen Coolidge to her husband, Joseph Coolidge, October 24, 1858, Ellen Coolidge Letterbook, pages 98-102, University of Virginia Library; also printed in Annette Gordon-Reed, *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings: An American Controversy* (Charlottesville, 1997), pages 258-260
- 1862** Recollections of Edmund Bacon, former Monticello overseer (original unlocated), printed in James A. Bear, Jr., ed., *Jefferson at Monticello* (Charlottesville, 1967), pages 28-117 (relevant page is 102)
- 1868** Letter of Jefferson biographer Henry S. Randall to James Parton, June 1, 1868, Harvard University Library; also printed in Milton E. Flower, *James Parton: The Father of Modern Biography* (Durham, 1951), pages 236-239
- 1873** Recollections of Madison Hemings, *Pike County [Ohio] Republican*, March 13, 1873; also printed in Gordon-Reed, pages 245-248
- 1873** Recollections of Israel Gillette Jefferson, former Monticello slave, *Pike County Republican*, December 25, 1873; also printed in Gordon-Reed, pages 249-253
- 1874** Letter of Jefferson's grandson Thomas Jefferson Randolph to editor of *Pike County Republican*, undated, University of Virginia Library, Accession Number 8937

These primary sources include the first public allegation of a Jefferson-Hemings relationship, by a Richmond journalist; a Jefferson letter viewed by some historians as a denial of the relationship; the transcribed interviews of a former Monticello overseer and two former slaves; the diary extracts of one of Jefferson's friends; and letters of two of Jefferson's grandchildren and a biographer who spoke to or corresponded with those grandchildren. Each document was examined with its context and audience in mind. What follows is a distillation of the committee's best understanding of each of these sources.

1802. Journalist James T. Callender, although his account is obviously sensationalized, stated that he was repeating what he had heard from others; he included some details that can be verified, and others that cannot.

1805. In the absence of the letter enclosed with it, the cover letter to Robert Smith remains somewhat ambiguous. Most historians interpret Jefferson's statements in the cover letter as his denial of all Federalist allegations against him, except for improper advances made forty years earlier to John Walker's wife, Elizabeth. These allegations included the relationship with Sally Hemings.

1850s. Jefferson's friend John Hartwell Cocke expressed his belief in the relationship many years after Jefferson's death.

1858, 1868, 1874. Jefferson's grandson Thomas Jefferson Randolph was the source of three versions of his family's explanation, which implicated one of Jefferson's Carr nephews, an explanation that is contradicted, in the case of Eston Hemings, by the DNA evidence.

1862. The published account of former overseer Edmund Bacon—indicating but not naming another man as the father of Sally Hemings's daughter Harriet (born 1801)—has problems of chronology: Bacon was not employed at Monticello until five years after Harriet Hemings's birth.

1873. The account of Madison Hemings, who stated that he and three of his siblings—Beverly, Harriet, and Eston—were the children of Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson, is taken as an authentic reflection of his observations and beliefs. Former Monticello slave Israel Gillette Jefferson, in a statement in the same year, corroborated Madison Hemings's assertion that Jefferson was his father. Madison Hemings also stated in the interview that his mother had no children by anyone other than his father.

Secondary Sources:

Douglass Adair, "The Jefferson Scandals," *Fame and the Founding Fathers*, ed. Trevor Colbourn (New York, 1974), pages 160-191.

Fawn M. Brodie, "The Great Jefferson Taboo," *American Heritage*, XXIII, no. 4 (June 1972), 48-57, 97-100. See also her *Thomas Jefferson: An Intimate Biography* (New York, 1974).

Virginius Dabney and Jon Kukla, "The Monticello Scandals: History and Fiction," *Virginia Cavalcade*, XXIX (Autumn, 1979), 52-61.

Annette Gordon-Reed, *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings: An American Controversy* (Charlottesville, 1997).

Winthrop D. Jordan, *White Over Black: American Attitudes Toward the Negro 1550-1812* (Chapel Hill, 1968), pages 461-481.

Dumas Malone, *Jefferson the President: First Term 1801-1805* (Boston, 1962), pages 213-216, 494-498. See also Dumas Malone and Steven H. Hochman, "A Note on Evidence: The Personal History of Madison Hemings," *Journal of Southern History*, XLI, No. 4 (November 1975), 523-528.

Dumas Malone, whose work is notable for its scholarship, doubted the likelihood of a relationship and accepted the Carr explanation. The other secondary sources disputing a relationship (Adair and Dabney-Kukla), although useful for the purposes of review, are uneven in their standards of assessment. This characteristic of their work was critically analyzed in Annette Gordon-Reed's book. While Fawn Brodie's work is at times farfetched, much of her scholarship has stood the test of time. Winthrop Jordan noted the correlation between Sally Hemings's conception windows and Thomas Jefferson's presence at Monticello and is helpful in interpreting the larger implications of the Jefferson-Hemings relationship.

Subsequent to the deliberations of the committee, the following work has been published: Jan Ellen Lewis and Peter S. Onuf, eds., *Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson: History, Memory, and Civic Culture* (Charlottesville, 1999). An issue of the *William and Mary Quarterly*, scheduled to appear in January 2000, will include a number of relevant essays.

IV. Research Findings and Implications

The following statements in bold type, taken from the documentary and oral history record, are considered uncontested historical or scientific facts. When viewed and interpreted in combination, these facts form the basis for our current understanding of the Jefferson-Hemings relationship. The commentary paragraphs explain the committee's interpretation of the facts. Supporting information can be found in cited Appendices.

1. The DNA of Eston Hemings's descendant matched that of Field Jefferson's descendants. (Appendices A , B, and J)

This result, now part of the historical record, provides scientific support for the statements of Madison Hemings and Israel Jefferson. While there is a scientific possibility that Randolph Jefferson (Jefferson's brother), one of his sons, or one of Field Jefferson's grandsons, was the father of Eston Hemings, the preponderance of known historical evidence indicates that Thomas Jefferson was his father. Randolph Jefferson and his sons are not known to have been at Monticello at the time of Eston Hemings's conception, nor has anyone, until 1998, ever before publicly suggested them as possible fathers. Field Jefferson's grandsons are unlikely candidates because of their distance from Monticello.

2. The DNA of John Carr's descendants did not match that of Eston Hemings's descendant. (Appendices A and B)

Jefferson's grandchildren Thomas Jefferson Randolph and Ellen Coolidge said that Jefferson's Carr nephews were the fathers of the children of Sally Hemings and her sister. The DNA study contradicts these statements in the case of Sally Hemings's last child, Eston. See No. 4 below for reasons to apply this conclusion to Hemings's other known children.

3. The DNA of Field Jefferson's descendants did not match that of Thomas C. Woodson's descendants. (Appendix K)

The DNA evidence indicates that, despite an enduring oral tradition in the Woodson family, Thomas Jefferson was not the father of Thomas C. Woodson. No documents have yet been found to support the belief that Woodson was Sally Hemings's first child, born soon after her return from France.

4. Sally Hemings's birth patterns match Thomas Jefferson's Monticello visitation patterns. (Appendix I)

The committee analyzed the timing of Jefferson's well-documented visits to Monticello and the births of Sally Hemings's children. According to this analysis, the observed correlation between Jefferson's presence at Monticello and the conception windows for Hemings's known children is far more likely if Jefferson or someone with an identical pattern of presence at and absence from Monticello was the father. There is no documentary evidence suggesting that Sally Hemings was away from Monticello when Jefferson was there during her conception windows.

5. Several people close to Jefferson or the Monticello community believed he was the father of Sally Hemings's children. (Appendix F)

Numerous sources document the prevailing belief in the neighborhood of Monticello that Jefferson had children by Sally Hemings. Of particular note are the views of John Hartwell Cocke, Jefferson's friend and frequent visitor to Monticello, and former Monticello slave Israel Gillette Jefferson. Cocke referred to Jefferson's "notorious example" when writing in his diary about the prevalence in Virginia of "masters with slave families" and Israel Jefferson confirmed Madison Hemings's claim of Jefferson paternity.

6. Madison Hemings stated in 1873 that he and his siblings (Beverly, Harriet, and Eston) were Thomas Jefferson's children. (Appendix E)

While the DNA results bear only on the paternity of Eston Hemings, the documents and birth patterns suggest a long-term relationship, which produced the children whose names appear in Jefferson's records. Even the statements of those who accounted for the paternity of Sally Hemings's children differently (Thomas Jefferson Randolph, Ellen Randolph Coolidge, and Edmund Bacon) never implied that Hemings's children had different fathers. Full-sibling relationships are further supported by the closeness of the family, as evidenced by documentation of siblings living together and naming children after each other. As mentioned in No. 3 above, there is no documentary evidence that Thomas C. Woodson was Sally Hemings's son.

7. Sally Hemings's children had unique access to freedom. (Appendix H)

Jefferson gave freedom to no other nuclear slave family. No other Monticello slaves achieved their freedom before the age of thirty-one (except for Critta Hemings's son James, who ran away). Harriet Hemings was the only enslaved woman freed in Jefferson's lifetime, and she was freed when she was

twenty-one years of age. The liberation of Sally Hemings's children cannot be wholly attributed to Jefferson's practice—as reported by his granddaughter Ellen Coolidge—of granting freedom to those light enough to pass for white or skilled enough to make their way as freed people, since there were other Monticello slaves, as light-skinned or as skilled, who were not freed.

8. The history of descent from Jefferson was passed down among Madison Hemings descendants. (Appendix G)

Despite a climate of hostility and denial, Madison Hemings's descendants carefully passed their family history of descent from Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson from generation to generation, often at important moments associated with rites of passage, family pride, or American history. Eston Hemings's descendants lived as white people and did not acknowledge Sally Hemings in their oral histories, in order to sever their connection with African Americans. They did, however, pass on the family tradition that they were related to Thomas Jefferson, but through one of his relatives. No descendants of Beverly and Harriet Hemings are known. For further information, see Lucia Stanton and Dianne Swann-Wright, “Bonds of Memory: Identity and the Hemings Family,” *Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson: History, Memory, and Civic Culture*, ed. Jan Ellen Lewis and Peter S. Onuf (Charlottesville, 1999).

9. Sally Hemings's children bore a striking resemblance to Thomas Jefferson. (Appendix F)

Thomas Jefferson Randolph told Henry S. Randall in the 1850s of the close resemblance of Sally Hemings's children to Thomas Jefferson. It was evidently their very light skin and pronounced resemblance to Jefferson that led to local talk of Jefferson's paternity. Eston Hemings, in Ohio in the 1840s, was noted as bearing a “striking” resemblance to Jefferson.

V. Assessment of Possible Paternity of Other Jeffersons

One reaction to the DNA study of Jefferson and Hemings descendants has been the accurate observation that the test results only prove that *a* Jefferson fathered the last of Sally Hemings's children—not that Thomas Jefferson himself was the father. In order to investigate this possibility, Monticello researchers reviewed Thomas Jefferson's papers as well as Jefferson family genealogies to determine the identities and whereabouts of other male members of his family.

Sally Hemings's confirmed times of conception extend from early December of 1794 through mid-September of 1807. During these eighteen years at least twenty-five adult male descendants of Jefferson's grandfather Thomas Jefferson (1677-1731) lived in Virginia: his younger brother Randolph and five of his sons, as well as one son and eighteen grandsons of his uncle Field Jefferson. Of this total, most were living in the Southside region—over a hundred miles from Monticello—and do not figure in Jefferson's correspondence or his memoranda.

There remained eight out of the twenty-five for whom age and proximity warranted further documentary investigation. These include Randolph Jefferson and his five sons (Isham, Thomas, Jr., Field, Robert, and Lilburne) as well as two grandsons of Field Jefferson (George and John Garland Jefferson). While each of these individuals had some interaction with Thomas Jefferson and some spent time at or in the vicinity of Monticello, most had no documented presence at Monticello during the times when Sally Hemings conceived her children. Several of them were at Monticello when Thomas Jefferson was absent (Sally Hemings is not known to have conceived in his absences). Randolph Jefferson's sons Thomas, in 1800, and Robert Lewis, in 1807, may well have been at Monticello during the conception periods of Harriet and Eston Hemings. Randolph Jefferson was invited to Monticello during the period of Eston Hemings's conception, but it is not known that he actually made the visit.

The committee concludes that convincing evidence does not exist for the hypothesis that another male Jefferson was the father of Sally Hemings's children. In almost two hundred years since the issue first became public, no other Jefferson has ever been referred to as the father; denials of Thomas Jefferson's paternity named the Carr nephews. Furthermore, evidence of the sort of sustained presence necessary to have resulted in the creation of a family of six children is entirely lacking, and even those who denied a relationship never suggested Sally Hemings's children had more than one father. Finally, the historical evidence for Thomas Jefferson's paternity of Eston Hemings and his known siblings overwhelmingly outweighs that for any other Jefferson.

See Appendix J for a more extended account of the investigation of this issue.

VI. Conclusions

Based on the examination of currently available primary and secondary documentary evidence, the oral histories of descendants of Monticello's African-American community, recent scientific studies, and the guidance of individual members of Monticello's Advisory Committee for the International Center for Jefferson Studies and Advisory Committee on African-American Interpretation, the Research Committee has reached the following conclusions:

1. Dr. Foster's DNA study was conducted in a manner that meets the standards of the scientific community, and its scientific results are valid.
2. The DNA study, combined with multiple strands of currently available documentary and statistical evidence, indicates a high probability that Thomas Jefferson fathered Eston Hemings, and that he most likely was the father of all six of Sally Hemings's children appearing in Jefferson's records. Those children are Harriet, who died in infancy; Beverly; an unnamed daughter who died in infancy; Harriet; Madison; and Eston.
3. Many aspects of this likely relationship between Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson are, and may remain, unclear, such as the nature of the relationship, the existence and longevity of Sally Hemings's first child, and the identity of Thomas C. Woodson.
4. The implications of the relationship between Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson should be explored and used to enrich the understanding and interpretation of Jefferson and the entire Monticello community.

Appendix A

Articles in the journal *Nature*:

Eugene A. Foster *et al.*, “Jefferson Fathered Slave’s Last Child,” November 5, 1998

Eric S. Lander and Joseph J. Ellis, “Founding Father,” November 5, 1998

Eugene A. Foster *et al.*, letter to editor, January 7, 1999

These articles are not reprinted in this .pdf version of the report, but are available on-line at: <http://www.nature.com>.

Links to the articles are posted at:

http://www.monticello.org/plantation/hemings_resource.html.

Appendix B

Opinions of Scientists Consulted

Dr. Kenneth K. Kidd, Professor of Genetics, Yale University, January 1999

“I have read and thought about the article quite a bit. First, there is nothing wrong with the science. The markers on the Y are well documented and most have been studied in several hundred men. The male to male transmission is about as basic in mammalian biology as you can get. All of the authors that I know personally (less than half of them) are very reputable and I trust them. So, the only ‘controversy’ that exists is over the interpretation.

“I think Eric Lander and Joseph Ellis in their News and Views commentary over-interpreted the results as proving that Jefferson was the father of Eston; I think the actual authors are more correct when they consider other explanations ‘unlikely.’ What the data do prove, beyond any reasonable doubt, is that Thomas Jefferson and H21, a descendant of Eston Hemings, had Y chromosomes that were identical by descent. The Y chromosome data do not prove that Thomas Jefferson himself was the ancestor of H21, but that is certainly one of the likely specific scenarios within the ‘identical by descent’ family of explanations.

“The term ‘identical by descent’ is standard population genetics terminology and means that the instances being considered, in this case the two Y chromosomes, Thomas Jefferson's and H21's, can be traced to a single common ancestral Y chromosome. That could be Thomas Jefferson's OR it could be an ancestor of Thomas Jefferson who was also an ancestor of H21. Obviously, the evidence favors Eston being the Great-Great Grandfather of H21 since there is no reason to question that lineage. Thus, the question becomes one of who Eston's father was. For example, J5, J12, J6, J13, and J14 look likely to have been alive and old enough to have fathered Eston and they have Y chromosomes identical by descent with Thomas Jefferson's. How many other male-line relatives of Thomas Jefferson were alive at that time? Did Thomas Jefferson II (Peter's and Field's father) have any brothers and/or any paternal uncles? One can go back this way to other male-line ancestors and then forward again among their male-line descendants to the relevant time. In sum, a male-line relative quite remotely related to President Thomas Jefferson would likely have the same Y chromosome as Jefferson. (For example, J41 and J49 are fifth cousins once removed and have the same Y chromosome.)

“The data do prove that Thomas Woodson was not the son of Thomas Jefferson or any close male-line relative of Jefferson. The Carr brothers are also excluded from being fathers of Eston or Thomas Woodson. Thus, as with modern day paternity testing, we can prove a man is/was not the father, but we cannot absolutely prove a man is/was the father.

“So, the proof ultimately rests on demonstrating that Thomas Jefferson was present at the time Eston was conceived and that no other male relative with the same Y chromosome was hiding in the bushes. This is something I have no knowledge of, but some of the people there at Monticello probably do know a lot in this area of history. Obviously, this can all get very sensitive if people get emotionally or personally involved. I personally think the simplest answer is that Jefferson was the father of Eston. He may have been the father of all of Sally Hemings's children except Thomas Woodson, and she may have thought that Jefferson was the father of Thomas Woodson as well.

“A comment about the statistics. There is fair uncertainty in the exact numbers that should be used because it is very difficult to estimate accurately a small number. But, it is clear that the specific Y chromosome pattern is rare--it was not seen elsewhere in a sample of over 600 European men. Thus, the authors are right when they say these results for H21 are at least 100 times more likely if Thomas Jefferson is Eston's father than if someone unrelated [to Jefferson] was the father. As noted above, however, that statement says ‘unrelated’ and J5, J6, etc. are all related. It is also correct to say ‘these results for H21 are at least 100 times more likely if Thomas Jefferson's cousin J5 [or J6 or J12 or ...] is Eston's father than if someone unrelated [to the Jeffersons] was the father.’

“One final comment. I notice that the pattern for the Woodson descendants is very similar to the pattern for the Carrs. It would not take many mutations to convert one into the other. That makes it possible that John Carr and Thomas Woodson had fathers who were male-line relatives within a few generations. That could just mean that their fathers came from the same town or county back in Europe since I do not know how common these particular allelic combinations are in Europe (England?).”

Dr. Mark E. Lovell, Director of the Molecular Biology Laboratory, University of Virginia School of Medicine, January 1999

Dr. Lovell felt that the tests were proper in all aspects. The specimens were collected and stored properly prior to the DNA extraction. They were randomly labeled and Dr. Foster was the only person with the identity code. Dr. Lovell's lab extracted the DNA and refrigerated the specimens in a locked refrigerator until Dr. Foster collected them to take to England. Three separate laboratories performed three separate and distinct marker identifications. When asked if the tests should be repeated by another independent investigator, Dr. Lovell said, “Probably not.” He said if anybody were trying to skew the results, he would have a much harder time making a match occur than to make a mismatch occur. The use of three labs and the almost identical results would tend to discourage other testing. When asked if he would do anything differently if he had been conducting the study, he said that he would not change the methodology, but would have had “witnessed” collections.

Dr. David Page, Associate Director, Whitehead Institute, MIT Center for Genome Research, December 1998

Dr. Page expressed no concerns about the basic design of the study and said that the labs that did the work are very reputable in Y-chromosome studies. He has full confidence in their technical competence. He said that if he has any concerns about the study, they would have to do with “bookkeeping” and the interpretation of results.

Basically, “bookkeeping” is worrying about a mistake, such as mixing up the test tubes, that could have led to the significant match. He would feel better if blood was redrawn from the Eston Hemings descendant and retyped.

Dr. Page felt that more thought and attention could be paid to the “competing hypotheses” in interpreting the results. He pointed out that, in these kinds of studies, “non-paternity” is a big problem, that it is observed (at least in the past fifty years or so) 10 percent of the time, that it makes for background “noise,” and that, in a case like this involving many generations, the non-paternity problem only increases. He called it “historical degradation.” He noted that this is more of a problem in the case of a non-match, as with the Woodsons and Carrs, making the interpretation of these non-matches more ambiguous.

He also wished more was known about “the local population structure around Monticello two hundred years ago,” as respects the Y chromosome. He would ask to what degree has the potential that it was somebody else’s gene been sampled.

Dr. Page stressed that there is a low probability that any of these possibilities represent true problems, but rather that they are the areas for which he might wish for more data, to shore up the authors’ favored conclusions.

Dr. Bruce Stillman, Director, Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory, February 1999

Mr. Stillman said that there was nothing exceptional in the methodology of the study. Scientists at Cold Spring Harbor know and respect the people who undertook the analysis. They feel the DNA study does not merit a scholarly conference since the science involved was so routine.

Appendix C

Hemings and Jefferson Family Trees

These family trees are not available as part of the .pdf version of this report. If you would like to request a copy of this information, please contact Monticello's Department of Public Affairs at 804-984-9822 (e-mail: publicaffairs@monticello.org).

Information about the Hemings family is available below in Appendix H, a compilation of documentary information on Sally Hemings and her children.

Information about male relatives of Jefferson is found above in Part V (Assessment of Possible Paternity of Other Jeffersons) and below in Appendix J, a summary of research on the possible paternity of other Jeffersons.

Appendix D

**Statement of Daniel P. Jordan, Ph.D.,
President, Thomas Jefferson Memorial Foundation**

**DNA Press Conference
at the International Center for Jefferson Studies,
November 1, 1998**

In the Jeffersonian tradition, the Foundation welcomes new information and insights. We saw Dr. Foster's article in *Nature* for the first time less than forty-eight hours ago, and we'll need more time to evaluate it thoroughly. Meanwhile, we eagerly look forward to public discussion of the conclusions reached in the article and to evaluations of those conclusions by the scientific and historical communities.

Dr. Foster's DNA evidence indicates a sexual relationship between Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings, an African-American woman who was one of his slaves. Slavery and race are uncomfortable subjects for many Americans - but they are in the mainstream of our interpretation at Monticello today precisely because they are part of the Monticello story. The Foundation has long believed that you cannot understand Thomas Jefferson without understanding slavery, and that you cannot understand Monticello without understanding its African-American community.

Further, we believe a scholarly approach is always the key as we seek to advance our core mission of preservation and education. The Monticello staff includes seven Ph.D.'s as well as six individuals who have written one or more books with a university press. The Foundation has its own research center, which fields approximately 1,100 serious queries a year from the media, scholars, and other interested parties seeking accurate information about Thomas Jefferson and his times.

The Foundation will evaluate carefully Dr. Foster's findings and any other relevant evidence on the subject; and then, in the Jefferson tradition, the Foundation will follow truth wherever it may lead us.

The Thomas Jefferson-Sally Hemings controversy is now almost two-hundred years old, and it is one about which honorable people have disagreed. Few Americans have been more vigorous advocates of scientific pursuits than Jefferson. To reduce the mysteries of the past and move us all closer to the truth is in the spirit of Thomas Jefferson.

Appendix E

Table of Contents of Relevant Primary Documents

Except the typescript of relevant extracts from several James Callender articles (see following pages), these documents are not available as part of the .pdf version of this report. They are available in the publications and from the organizations cited below.

1802	James Thomson Callender, extracts of articles in Richmond <i>Recorder</i> , September through December	
	Original, September 1, 1802 article	Page 1
	Typescript of extracts from several articles	3-5
1805	Jefferson cover letter to Secretary of the Navy Robert Smith, July 1, 1805	
	Original, Missouri Historical Society	6
	Printed version from <i>Thomas Jefferson Correspondence</i> , ed. Worthington C. Ford (Boston, 1916), pages 114-115	7-8
1850s	Journal of John Hartwell Cocke, January 26, 1853, and April 23, 1859, extracts	
	Originals, University of Virginia Library	9-12
	Typescript of extracts	13-14
1858	Letter of Jefferson's granddaughter Ellen Coolidge to her husband, Joseph Coolidge, October 24, 1858	
	Original, Ellen Coolidge Letterbook, pages 98-102, University of Virginia Library	15-19
	Printed version from Annette Gordon-Reed, <i>Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings: An American Controversy</i> (Charlottesville, 1997), pages 258-260	20-21
1862	Recollections of Edmund Bacon, former Monticello overseer (original unlocated)	
	Printed version from James A. Bear, Jr., ed., <i>Jefferson at Monticello</i> (Charlottesville, 1967), pages 28-117 (relevant page is 102)	22-23
1868	Letter of Jefferson biographer Henry S. Randall to James Parton, June 1, 1868 (original in Harvard University Library)	
	Printed version from Milton E. Flower, <i>James Parton: The Father of Modern Biography</i> (Durham, 1951), pages 236-239	24-26
1873	Recollections of Madison Hemings, <i>Pike County [Ohio] Republican</i> , March 13, 1873	
	Original, Ohio Historical Society	27-28
	Printed version from Gordon-Reed, pages 245-248	29-31
1873	Recollections of Israel Gillette Jefferson, <i>Pike County Republican</i> , December 25, 1873 (original in Ohio Historical Society)	
	Printed version from Gordon-Reed, pages 249-253	32-34
1874	Letter of Jefferson's grandson Thomas Jefferson Randolph to editor of <i>Pike County Republican</i> , undated	
	Original, University of Virginia Library, Accession Number 8937	35-40
	Typescript version	41-44

James Thomson Callender
Relevant extracts in *Richmond Recorder*, 1802

Sep. 1:

"THE PRESIDENT AGAIN.

It is well known that the man, *whom it delighteth the people to honor*, keeps, and for many years past has kept, as his concubine, one of his own slaves. Her name is SALLY. The name of her eldest son is TOM. His features are said to bear a striking although sable resemblance to those of the president himself. The boy is ten or twelve years of age. His mother went to France in the same vessel with Mr. Jefferson and his two daughters. The delicacy of this arrangement must strike every person of common sensibility. What a sublime pattern for an American ambassador to place before the eyes of two young ladies.

If the reader does not feel himself *disposed to pause* we beg leave to proceed. Some years ago, this story had once or twice been hinted at in *Rind's Federalist*. At that time, we believed the surmise to be an absolute calumny. One reason for thinking so was this. A vast body of people wished to debar Mr. Jefferson from the presidency. *The establishment of this SINGLE FACT* would have rendered his election impossible. We reasoned thus; that if the allegation had been true, it was sure to have been ascertained and advertised by his enemies in every corner of the continent. The suppression of so decisive an enquiry serves to shew that the common sense of the federal party was overruled by divine providence....

By this wench Sally, our president has had several children. There is not an individual in the neighbourhood of Charlottesville who does not believe the story, and not a few who know it....

If the friends of Mr. Jefferson are convinced of *his* innocence, they will make an appeal of the same sort. If they rest in silence, or if they content themselves with resting upon a *general denial*, they can not hope for credit. The allegation is of a nature too *black* to be suffered to remain in suspense. We should be glad to hear of its refutation. We give it to the world under the firmest belief that such a refutation *never can be made*. The AFRICAN VENUS is said to officiate, as housekeeper at Monticello. When Mr. Jefferson has read this article, he will find leisure to estimate how much has been lost or gained by so many unprovoked attacks upon

J. T. CALLENDER"

Sep. 15:

In presumably fictional advertisement for a set of prints of Jefferson and Hemings, Callender mentions "five healthy mahogany-featured children frisking about the floor."

Sep. 22:

"MORE ABOUT SALLY AND THE PRESIDENT.

FOR two days after the publication of the Recorder of September 1st. the democrats were at a loss what to say or think. The Philistine priesthood were not more confounded, when they saw their idol Dagon prostrate and broke to pieces. The Demos set out with a sturdy denial of Sally's existence. They had been in this country during their whole lives. They had never heard a word of her. *How then should Callender get hold of the story?* Depend upon it, sir, the whole must be a lie. It cannot possibly be true. A thing so brutal, so disgraceful! A thing so foreign to Mr. Jefferson's character!....[The Democrats] affirmed that the author of so vile a slander should get his ears cut off. Others were for hanging him. The house rung with clamours of execration and revenge. But alas! their triumph was very short. There was only one part of the statement wherein Callender was wrong. The negro wench did *not* go to France in the same vessel with the president. Mr. Jefferson hi[].....[*part of article missing in our copy*]....

SALLY's business makes a prodigious noise here. You may save yourself the trouble of a moment's doubt in believing the story. But what will your pious countrymen upon the Connecticut say to such African amours? After this discovery I do not believe that, at the next election of 1804, Jefferson could obtain two votes on the Eastern side of the Susquehanna; and I think hardly four upon this side of it. He will, therefore, be laid aside."

Sep. 29:

"After we thought that the public had enough upon the remission business, MRS. SARAH JEFFERSON was brought forward. After this exhibition shall have thundered from Penobscott, to the Natches, then, as Dr. Morgan says, 'you shall peradventure, behold what you shall see!' In a word, the political character of Thomas Jefferson has been safely deposited in its grave, and The Recorder shall take the trouble of erecting its tomb-stone....

Now as Mr. Madison has been acquainted with Jefferson for at least 30 years, he must have been acquainted with this mulatto business, which, in the course of the present rupture, has burst into history. The name of SALLY will walk down to posterity alongside of Mr. Jefferson's own name. The name of Agrippina is as distinctly remembered as that of Nero. Madison must have known all about Sally, and *when he assisted in passing off the president as a prodigy of virtue*, he differed from the president himself precisely as much as the man that circulates a copper dollar, differs from the man that forged it."

Nov. 3:

"THE Lynchburg Gazette has a long article about SALLY. This piece contains a great deal of censure upon the writer of the present article....The piece referred to contains various blunders, an accident which was to be feared from Mr. Carter's editorial character. One of

these bulls is that our little mulatto president, the fellow TOM, went to France along with his mother. We have some small reasons for thinking that TOM did not exist, at the time of the French embassy. He is not *big enough*, at least our correspondent thinks so, to have been in existence fifteen or sixteen years ago. Our information goes to twelve or thirteen years; and that's enough!"

Nov. 10:

"Sally's brother was set free by the president. He has an infirmity in one of his arms. During the sitting of last assembly, he sold fruit in the capitol. It is said, but we do not give it as gospel, that one of her daughters is a house servant to a person in this city. This wench must have been by some other father than the president."

Nov. 17:

"[Meriwether] Jones [editor of Richmond *Examiner*] introduces black Sally; and as he says not one word in defence or exculpation of Mr. Jefferson, we presume that he has given up the point....

We shall not have done with these fine stories for six months to come....What between the expenditure of public money by the executive council; and all that we have to say about Albemarle amours; and all that we have to say about that other lady, into whose hands the card was put; and all the rest about the mulatto plantation, and about Sally's previous husbands; and all about Mr. Gabriel Jones, of Rockingham, you cannot imagine what a grand harvest the Recorder of this winter will offer to the *curiosity of the quid nuncs....*"

Dec. 8:

"From the Frederick-Town Herald. PRESIDENT JEFFERSON....Other information assures us, that Mr. Jefferson's Sally and their children are real persons, that the woman herself has a room to herself at Monticello in the character of sempstress to the family, if not as house-keeper; that she is an industrious and orderly creature in her behaviour, but that her intimacy with her master is well known, and that on this account, she is treated by the rest of his house as one much above the level of his other servants. Her son, whom Callender calls president Tom, we also are assured, bears a strong likeness to Mr. Jefferson."

Appendix F

THE HEMINGS-JEFFERSON CONTROVERSY A Review of the Documentary Evidence

UNQUESTIONED:

Sally Hemings (1773-1835) was a Monticello slave and she had a number of children.

Jefferson's records and Madison Hemings's recollections agree in recording four children of Sally Hemings who reached adulthood: three sons, Beverly, Madison, and Eston, and a daughter, Harriet. Although there is no reference in Jefferson's records to a child born before Harriet (1795), strong oral traditions in the Thomas C. Woodson family state that he was Sally Hemings's oldest child, born in 1790.

Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson were both at Monticello at the probable conception times of her children with known birthdates. There is no record of any children born to Sally Hemings at times that rule out possible Thomas Jefferson paternity.

Jefferson himself, in his Farm Book and one letter, provided the dates for the known births: 5 Oct. 1795 (Harriet, who died in infancy); 1 Apr. 1798 (Beverly); circa 7 Dec. 1799 (daughter, possibly named Thenia, who died in infancy); May 1801 (Harriet); Jan. 1805 (Madison); 21 May 1808 (Eston) (Farm Book, pp. 57, 128; 1799 Jefferson letter; Madison Hemings provided the day of his own birth—Jan. 19—in his 1873 recollections).

There is no record that Sally Hemings was anywhere but at Monticello from 1790 to 1826. Jefferson was living permanently at Monticello in 1794 and 1795. He was there from 11 July to 5 Dec. 1797; 8 Mch. to 21 Dec. 1799; 29 May to 24 Nov. 1800; 4 Apr. to 11 May 1804; and 4 Aug. to 30 Sep. 1807 (James A. Bear, Jr., and Lucia C. Stanton, eds., *Thomas Jefferson's Memorandum Books 1767-1826* [Princeton, 1997]).

Sally Hemings's children were very lightskinned and some passed into white society.

Public records reveal that Sally Hemings's son Eston (1808-1856) left Ohio for Wisconsin in 1852 and there he and his family lived as members of white society. His descendants identify themselves as white. Madison Hemings's recollections state that his brother Beverly "went to Washington as a white man" and his sister Harriet assumed "the role of a white woman"; both had white spouses. Their descendants are presently unknown (1873 Madison Hemings recollections; Getting Word project files).

Some of Sally Hemings's children resembled Thomas Jefferson.

Thomas Jefferson Randolph, son of Jefferson's daughter Martha, told biographer Henry S. Randall that Sally Hemings's children resembled his

grandfather "so closely that it was plain that they had his blood in their veins." He recalled the astonishment of one Monticello dinner guest who noted the striking resemblance to Jefferson of the servant standing behind him. Randolph attributed this resemblance to the paternity of one of Jefferson's Carr nephews (1868 Randall letter).

In the 1840s several Ohio citizens were struck by the resemblance of Eston Hemings to a statue of Jefferson they had seen in Washington, DC (1902 *Scioto Gazette*).

Thomas Jefferson freed Sally Hemings's children.

The children of Sally Hemings that are known from Jefferson's records all became free by the age of twenty-one, the only case of an entire enslaved Monticello family achieving freedom. Hemings's youngest sons Madison and Eston were given their freedom in Jefferson's 1826 will. Her son Beverly and daughter Harriet left Monticello in 1821 or 1822, without being pursued as runaways and, presumably, with Jefferson's blessing. Former Monticello overseer Edmund Bacon recalled that, "by Jefferson's direction," he paid Harriet Hemings's stage fare to the north and gave her fifty dollars. Jefferson's granddaughter Ellen Coolidge wrote in 1858 that "three young men and one girl," who were "sufficiently white to pass for white," were allowed "to withdraw quietly from the plantation; it was called running away, but they were never reclaimed" (1826 will; Farm Book, p. 130; 1862 Edmund Bacon recollections, p. 102; 1858 Ellen Coolidge letter).

TESTIMONY OF JEFFERSON AND SALLY HEMINGS:

Jefferson made no public denial of a connection to Sally Hemings, nor has any record been found that he ever commented on the paternity of her children. An ambiguous private letter of 1805 has been interpreted by some historians as a denial.

It was Jefferson's "rule of life" not to respond to newspaper attacks and never to "harrass the public with fendings and provings of personal slander." In 1805, when Federalist newspapers renewed their assaults on his character, Jefferson wrote letters of explanation to some close political associates. These letters are lost, but, in a surviving cover letter to his Secretary of Navy, Jefferson admitted making improper advances to the wife of a friend many years before, adding that "it is the only one founded in truth among all their allegations against me." Some historians view this as a reference to "allegations" about the Hemings issue, while others believe that it refers only to the accusations of the offended husband and his associates (Lucia Stanton, "Looking for Liberty: Thomas Jefferson and the British Lions," *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 26 no. 4, [summer 1993], p. 652; 1805 Jefferson letter).

There is only one known account of the subject being raised in Jefferson's presence. As Jefferson's Randolph granddaughters told biographer Henry S. Randall, Jefferson's daughter Martha Randolph, roused to indignation by Irish

poet Thomas Moore's couplet linking her father with a slave, thrust the offending poem in front of him one day at Monticello. Jefferson's only response was a "hearty, clear laugh" (Randall, *The Life of Thomas Jefferson* [Philadelphia, 1865], 3: 118-119).

Sally Hemings left no known comments on the connection except what can be inferred from the recollections of her son Madison.

There are no known documents in Sally Hemings's hand nor accounts of any statements made by her. Her son Madison, who stated in 1873 that he was Thomas Jefferson's son, did not specifically mention when or how he learned the identity of his father. His account of circumstances relating to his mother's relationship to Jefferson--such as her reluctance to leave France in 1789 and Jefferson's promise to free her children at the age of twenty-one--gives the impression that she was the source of his information (1873 Madison Hemings recollections).

TESTIMONY OF JEFFERSON AND HEMINGS FAMILY MEMBERS:

Jefferson's daughter Martha Randolph and two of her children denied the story to friends and family members. Jefferson's Randolph grandchildren named one of their Carr cousins as the father of Sally Hemings's children.

In 1874, Jefferson's grandson Thomas Jefferson Randolph wrote that every member of his family "repelled with indignation this calumny....To my own knowledge and that of others 60 years ago the paternity of these parties were admitted by others." Randolph told biographer Henry S. Randall that his mother asked her sons always to defend their grandfather's character and reminded them that the Hemings who most resembled Jefferson could not have been his child, since he and Sally Hemings were "far distant from each other" for fifteen months before the birth. Randolph also told Randall that the father of Sally Hemings's children was Jefferson's nephew Peter Carr and that Carr had admitted this connection to him. Randolph's sister Ellen Coolidge gave a similar account, as heard from her brother, in a letter to her husband. She named Samuel Carr, however, instead of his brother Peter, as the father of Sally Hemings's children (1874 Randolph letter; 1868 Randall letter; 1858 Coolidge letter).

Sally Hemings's son Madison stated that Jefferson was his father. Her son Eston took the surname Jefferson as an adult.

In 1873, Madison Hemings told a newspaper reporter that he was Jefferson's son, recalling that his mother became Jefferson's "concubine" in France and was pregnant with his child (who lived "but a short time") on their return to Virginia in 1789. Jefferson, he said, was "the father of all of [her children]," naming himself, Beverly, Harriet, and Eston (1873 Madison Hemings recollections).

Eston Hemings's only recorded comment on his paternity is ambiguous. He left Ohio for Wisconsin in 1852, changed his racial identity, and changed his name to Eston Hemings Jefferson (1902 *Scioto Gazette*; 1873 Madison Hemings recollections; Getting Word project files).

The family history of Sally Hemings's descendants, transmitted orally over many generations, states that Hemings and Thomas Jefferson are their ancestors.

The deeply-held belief in descent from Jefferson has been recorded in interviews with over twenty descendants of Madison Hemings and Thomas C. Woodson. At some point in the twentieth century, the family history among descendants of Eston Hemings--who identify themselves as white--was altered to state that their ancestor was not Thomas Jefferson, but his uncle (Getting Word project files).

VIEWS OF OTHER MONTICELLO RESIDENTS:

Edmund Bacon, Monticello overseer from 1806 to 1822, stated that Jefferson was not the father of Sally Hemings's children.

Bacon told Hamilton Pierson in 1862 that "people said" Jefferson freed Sally Hemings's daughter Harriet "because she was his own daughter. She was not his daughter; she was ---'s daughter. I know that. I have seen him come out of her mother's room many a morning when I went up to Monticello very early." Pierson presumably deleted the name of the father for publication; the original manuscript has not been located. Harriet Hemings was born in 1801, five years before Bacon's arrival at Monticello (1862 Bacon recollections, p. 102).

Israel Gillette Jefferson, a slave at Monticello from his birth in 1800 until 1827, corroborated Madison Hemings's claim of Jefferson paternity.

In 1873, Israel Jefferson, at the time a neighbor of Madison Hemings, told an Ohio newspaperman that Sally Hemings was Jefferson's "concubine" and that Beverly, Harriet, Madison, and Eston Hemings were Jefferson's children. He would have been eight years old at the time of the birth of Sally Hemings's youngest child, Eston (1873 Israel Jefferson recollections).

VIEWS OF JEFFERSON'S ACQUAINTANCES:

1802. David Humphreys, who had been secretary to the American legation in Paris while Jefferson was ambassador, did not believe the story.

A Philadelphia newspaper reported that Humphreys "has shown that the story of Sally was a falsehood." Humphreys had left Paris before Sally Hemings arrived in 1787 (note from Philadelphia *Aurora* in Richmond *Recorder*, 1 Dec. 1802).

1802. Gen. Henry (Light-Horse Harry) Lee, a Federalist, was also not a believer.

A Philadelphia newspaper reported that Lee, "who cannot be suspected of partiality for Mr. Jefferson, declared at general Bloomfield's table at Trenton a few days since, that there is no foundation whatsoever for that story" (note from Philadelphia *Aurora* in Richmond *Recorder*, 1 Dec. 1802).

1810. John Adams's ambiguous reference to the story has been interpreted by historians as reflecting both belief and disbelief in its truth.

Adams, who was estranged from Jefferson at this time, stated his strong disapproval of Jefferson's financial contributions to James T. Callender, whose testimony on any subject Adams considered not worthy of belief. He continued: "Callender and Sally will be remembered as long as Jefferson, as blots in his character. The story of the latter is a natural and almost unavoidable consequence of that foul Contagion in the human Character, Negro Slavery" (Adams to Colonel Ward, 8 Jan. 1810, Massachusetts Historical Society). Adams had known Jefferson well in Paris in 1784 and 1785 and met Sally Hemings in London in 1787; his subsequent contact with Jefferson was in New York and Philadelphia. Joseph Ellis, in *American Sphinx: The Character of Thomas Jefferson* (1997), interpreted Adams's statement as doubt of the story's truth; Page Smith, in *Jefferson: A Revealing Biography* (1976), expressed the opposite opinion.

c1851. Dr. Robley Dunglison, Jefferson's doctor in 1825 and 1826, did not believe the story.

Dunglison, an Englishman who first arrived in Virginia in 1825, told Jefferson biographer Henry S. Randall that "in his own secret mind" he believed Thomas J. Randolph's version of the story (1868 Randall letter).

1853 and 1859. John Hartwell Cocke, Jefferson's friend and fellow member of the Board of Visitors of the University of Virginia, believed in Jefferson's connection with Sally Hemings.

Decades after Jefferson's death, Cocke referred in his diary to the prevalence in Virginia of masters with slave families--"nor is it to be wondered at, when Mr. Jefferson's notorious example is considered." He also mentioned the "damnable practice" of bachelor plantation owners keeping slave mistresses, even more common in Virginia than elsewhere, "as Mr. Jefferson's example can be pleaded for its defence" (Cocke journal, 26 Jan. 1853, 23 Apr. 1859, University of Virginia Library).

TESTIMONY BEYOND THE CIRCLE OF FAMILY AND ACQUAINTANCE:

1801-1802. Federalist newspapers hinted at a relationship between President Jefferson and a slave.

In 1801 and 1802 the *Washington Federalist* printed doggerel verse insinuating a sexual liaison between Jefferson and slaves, and, on 14 Sep. 1801, wrote that "Mr. J.," "a man very high in office, has a number of yellow children and that he is addicted to golden affections."

1802. Federalist journalist James Thomson Callender was the first to publish a specific account of Jefferson's connection to Sally Hemings.

In the *Richmond Recorder*, 1 Sep. 1802, Callender first published the allegation that it was "well known" that Jefferson kept a slave "concubine," whose name was Sally, and that their eldest son was Tom, age ten or twelve, who looked "strikingly" like Jefferson. He said he had learned this story from some "Virginia Gentlemen." Callender's story quickly spread throughout the Federalist press and became national in its range. It was heard and published by European visitors, northern abolitionists, and others who were not personally acquainted with Jefferson.

1802. Soon after Callender's article, Georgia Federalist Thomas Gibbons confirmed the story to a fellow Federalist.

Gibbons wrote Jonathan Dayton that it is "as correct as truth itself" that Jefferson lived "in open defiance of all decent rule, with a Mulatto slave his property, named Sally"--naming their children Tom, Beverly, and Harriet ("tho I never saw any one of them") (1802 Gibbons letter).

1811. Elijah P. Fletcher, Vermont schoolteacher and future mayor of Lynchburg, Virginia, reported that Albemarle County citizens believed the story.

Passing through Charlottesville, Fletcher talked to members of both political parties, who told "many anecdotes much to [Jefferson's] disgrace." He gained the impression that "the story of Black Sal is no farce -- That he cohabits with her and has a number of children by her is a sacred truth" (1811 Fletcher letter).

1840. Thomas C. Woodson was described in a newspaper as "the son of his master" (*The Colored American*, 31 Oct. 1840).

1870. Madison Hemings was described as Jefferson's son by an Ohio census taker (US Census, Ross County, Ohio, 1870).

1887 and 1902. Citizens of Chillicothe, Ohio, recalled that Eston Hemings resembled Jefferson and was reported to be his son.

Two late-nineteenth-century newspaper accounts, recalling events from the time of Eston Hemings's 1837-1852 residence in Chillicothe, referred to local rumor that he was the son of Thomas Jefferson. One noted that he bore a "striking resemblance" to Jefferson, had hair with "a tint of auburn," and was over six feet tall. Eston Hemings's Virginia free register, in 1832, recorded his height as 6' 1" (1902 *Scioto Gazette*; Chillicothe *Leader*, 26 Jan. 1887; Albemarle County Minute Book, 1832-1843, p. 12).

1908. A newspaper notice on the death of Beverly Jefferson, son of Eston Hemings Jefferson, described him as "a grandson of Thomas Jefferson" (Notice to the Chicago *Tribune*, Nov. 1908).

1916. Thomas Wesley Woodson was described as the great-grandson of Thomas Jefferson in the *Centennial Encyclopedia of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (1916).

CONTEMPORARY COMMENT ON JOHN WAYLES PATERNITY

No reference to Jefferson's father-in-law, John Wayles, as the father of Sally Hemings and some of her siblings, has been found in the papers of Jefferson and his family.

1802. Georgia Federalist Thomas Gibbons wrote about the story of the Hemings-Jefferson liaison, "and what adds to the monstrous disgrace of this amorous encounter is first that she is half sister to his first wife...." (1802 Gibbons letter).

1805. In a letter printed in a Boston newspaper, Virginian Thomas Turner reported that "an opinion has existed" that Sally Hemings was "the natural daughter" of John Wayles, father of Martha Jefferson (*Boston Repertory*, 31 May 1805).

1847. Isaac Jefferson, former Monticello slave, told the Rev. Charles Campbell that "folks said" John Wayles was the father of Sally Hemings and some of her siblings (Isaac Jefferson recollections, in James A. Bear, Jr., *Jefferson at Monticello* [Charlottesville, 1967], p. 4).

1873. Sally Hemings's son Madison told an Ohio newspaperman that his grandmother Betty Hemings was John Wayles's "concubine" and had six children, including Sally Hemings, by him (1873 Madison Hemings recollections).

Sources:

Farm Book Facsimile pages of Edwin M. Betts, ed., *Thomas Jefferson's Farm Book* (Princeton, 1953)

Getting Word project files Public records, newspaper accounts, interview transcripts, and other primary and secondary material relating to Monticello's African-American families and their descendants. Collected as part of Getting Word, Monticello's African-American Oral History Project, 1993 to the present.

• • • • •

1799 Thomas Jefferson to John Wayles Eppes, 21 Dec. 1799, University of Virginia Library

1802 Thomas Gibbons to Jonathan Dayton, 20 Dec. 1802, Clements Library, University of Michigan

1805 Thomas Jefferson to Robert Smith, 1 July 1805, in W. C. Ford, ed., *Thomas Jefferson Correspondence* (Boston, 1916)

1811 Elijah Fletcher to Jesse Fletcher, 24 May 1811, in Martha von Briesen, ed., *The Letters of Elijah Fletcher* (Charlottesville, 1965)

1826 Thomas Jefferson will and codicil, 16-17 Mch. 1826, in James A. Bear, Jr., *Jefferson at Monticello* (Charlottesville, 1967), pp. 118-122

1858 Ellen Randolph Coolidge to Joseph Coolidge, 24 Oct. 1858, in Annette Gordon-Reed, *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings: An American Controversy* (Charlottesville, 1997), pp. 258-260

1862 Edmund Bacon recollections, in Bear, *Jefferson at Monticello*, pp. 27-117

1868 Henry S. Randall letter to James Parton, 1 June 1868, in Gordon-Reed, *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings*, pp. 254-257

1873 Madison Hemings recollections, *Pike County [Ohio] Republican*, 13 Mch. 1873, in Gordon-Reed, *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings*, pp. 245-248

1873 Israel Jefferson recollections, *Pike County Republican*, 25 Dec. 1873, in Gordon-Reed, *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings*, pp. 249-253

1874 Thomas J. Randolph letter to editor of *Pike County Republican*, post-25 Dec. 1873, University of Virginia Library

1902 *Daily Scioto Gazette* [Chillicothe, Ohio], 1 Aug. 1902

Lucia C. Stanton, Shannon Senior Research Historian, Monticello December 1998

Appendix G

Oral History in the Hemings Family

In 1993, the Thomas Jefferson Memorial Foundation inaugurated a research project called Getting Word, to locate the descendants of Monticello's African-American community and to record and preserve their stories and histories. Since then, project staff have interviewed over a hundred people, including twenty-two descendants of Sally Hemings's son Madison and four descendants of his brother Eston. It was learned that Madison Hemings's descendants have passed their history through as many as eight generations. In a climate of disbelief and hostility, they continued to tell their children and grandchildren of their descent from Thomas Jefferson, often at significant times in their lives—at a coming of age, or an important moment of transition, or an intersection with history. One descendant passed on the story of her heritage when her granddaughter won a DAR history prize. The importance of the family history is reflected in the fact that, in almost every case, the account of their ancestry was the only story that came down the generations from the times of slavery.

For Eston Hemings Jefferson's descendants, the story of connection to Thomas Jefferson also remained alive, altered to protect their passing into the white world. They heard that they were descended from Jefferson's uncle, and Eston Hemings's name and the places the family had resided were changed, in order to sever their connection with Sally Hemings and African Americans.

For a more extended account of the oral history in the Hemings family, see Lucia Stanton and Dianne Swann-Wright, "Bonds of Memory: Identity and the Hemings Family," in *Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson: History, Memory, and Civic Culture*, ed. Jan Ellen Lewis and Peter S. Onuf (Charlottesville, 1999).

Appendix H

SALLY HEMINGS AND HER CHILDREN Information from Documentary Sources

SALLY HEMINGS

Name: Probably Sarah (Sally was the common diminutive form of this name).

Born: 1773 (FB.9)

Parents: Elizabeth (Betty) Hemings (c. 1735-1807) and, according to Sally Hemings's son Madison, John Wayles (d. 1773), father of Jefferson's wife, Martha Wayles Skelton Jefferson. (FB.9, 18; Madison Hemings 1873)

Children: Known from Jefferson's records: Harriet (1795-1797); Beverly (1798-post 1822); Harriet (1801-post 1822); daughter (1799-1800); Madison (1805-1877); Eston (1808-1856).

According to the oral history of the descendants of Thomas C. Woodson (1790-1879), he was Sally Hemings's first child; no documentary information has yet been found to confirm this.

Descriptions:

1787. Abigail Adams, London: "The Girl who is with her [Mary Jefferson] is quite a child, and Captain Ramsey is of opinion will be of so little Service that he had better carry her back with him. But of this you will be a judge. She seems fond of the child and appears good naturd." (Abigail Adams to TJ, 27 June 1787, B.11.503)

1787 Abigail Adams, London: "The Girl she [Mary Jefferson] has with her, wants more care than the child, and is wholly incapable of looking properly after her, without some superiour to direct her." (Abigail Adams to TJ, 6 July 1787, B.11.551)

1847. Isaac Jefferson, former Monticello slave: "Sally Hemings' mother Betty was a bright mulatto woman, and Sally mighty near white....Sally was very handsome, long straight hair down her back." (Bear.4)

c1851. Thomas J. Randolph, Jefferson's grandson, as told to Henry S. Randall: "Both the Henings [sic] girls were light colored and decidedly goodlooking." (Randall 1868)

Hearsay:

1802 Anonymous: "She is an industrious and orderly creature in her behaviour." (Fredericktown *Herald*, reprinted in Richmond *Recorder*, 8 Dec. 1802)

Residences:

In Jan. 1774, at the time of the division of John Wayles's estate, living with her mother and siblings at Wayles's Guinea plantation, Cumberland County. (FB.9)

Shortly after Jan. 1774, when Thomas and Martha Jefferson inherited Betty Hemings and her children on the division of the Wayles estate, moved with her family to the Elk Hill plantation in Goochland County. (FB.18)

Probably some time in 1775, came with her family to Monticello.

Probably in 1784, accompanied Jefferson's younger daughter, Mary, to live at Eppington in Chesterfield County; Jefferson and his older daughter, Martha, had left for France in July.

In May 1787, boarded a ship with Mary Jefferson for the journey from Virginia to Europe, spent two weeks in London with John and Abigail Adams, and then traveled with Jefferson's butler to Paris, where they arrived July 15. (Abigail Adams letters cited above; Bear.101; MB.674)

July 1787 to October 1789, probably lived at Jefferson's residence on the Champs-Élysées, the Hôtel de Langeac; it is also possible that she may have lived with Jefferson's daughters at their convent school, the Abbaye de Panthemont.

Returned to Virginia with Jefferson and his daughters to Monticello, arriving 23 Dec. 1789. (MB.749)

1789 to 1827, no record that she left Monticello.

From 1827 to death in 1835, lived in Charlottesville, probably on West Main Street. Her son Madison recalled that, after Jefferson's death, he and his brother Eston "rented a house and took mother to live with us, till her death." Eston Hemings, however, seems to have moved to his own house on East Main Street after his marriage in 1832. (Madison Hemings 1873; Stanton, "Monticello to Main Street," pp. 107-108)

Paris years:

Monticello overseer Edmund Bacon remembered in 1860 that Sally Hemings talked about her transatlantic journey: "Sally Hemings went to France with Maria Jefferson when she was a little girl....They crossed the ocean alone. I have often heard her tell about it." (Bear.100)

Whether Sally Hemings lived at Jefferson's residence or with his daughters at the convent school is not certainly known. Whatever the case, as lady's maid to Martha and Maria Jefferson, she became acquainted with their friends. Two letters confirm this: Maria Jefferson wrote her friend Kitty Church in 1789, "Sally vous dit bien des choses"; after the Jefferson family's return to Virginia, a French classmate wrote to Martha Jefferson, "Dis bien des choses a Mlle. Sale." (B.16.xxxi; Marie de Botidoux to Martha Jefferson, Nov. 1789--Jan. 1790, University of Virginia Library)

Jefferson paid an English physician in Nov. 1787 for inoculating Sally Hemings against smallpox, in accordance with his practice of having domestic servants who attended on himself or his daughters inoculated. (MB.685)

In the spring of 1789 Jefferson paid his launderer for boarding Sally Hemings for five weeks. The reason for this temporary residence is not known. It could reflect a period of training in laundering fine fabrics (appropriate for a lady's maid), a quarantine period after smallpox inoculation (with payment more than a year after the fact), or a temporary

housing situation while Jefferson's daughters made the transition between living at the convent and at Jefferson's house. (MB.731)

Also in the spring of 1789, Jefferson spent the equivalent of \$32 on clothing for Sally Hemings. In the same period, Jefferson spent almost ten times as much on the clothing of his daughter Martha, who was just beginning to go out into society and to balls. Sally, as her lady's maid, would also have needed an improved wardrobe. (MB.729-734)

In Jan. 1788 and then monthly from Nov. 1788 to their departure from Paris in Sep. 1789, Jefferson paid Sally Hemings a small wage, the equivalent of \$2 a month. The Parisian scullion made \$2.50 a month, Sally's brother, James Hemings, made \$4 a month as chef, and the other French servants earned from \$8 to \$12 a month. (MB.690, 718, 721, 722, 725)

According to her son Madison, Sally Hemings left Paris when "she was just beginning to learn the French language well." (Madison Hemings 1873)

Although the laws in France did not permit slavery, slaves brought into the country had to petition the government to achieve their freedom, a process that was usually successful, but could be complicated. Sally and James Hemings would almost certainly have been aware of their right to freedom and the means to achieve it; there was a community of former slaves in Paris and freedom cases were brought and won in this period. Jefferson told another American who enquired about the status of his enslaved domestic servant: "I...find that the laws of France give him freedom if he claims it, and that it will be difficult, if not impossible, to interrupt the course of the law." He continued, evidently referring to his own case with James Hemings, "Nevertheless I have known an instance where a person bringing in a slave, and saying nothing about it, has not been disturbed in his possession." As Madison Hemings recalled his mother's situation, "in France she was free, while if she returned to Virginia she would be re-enslaved." (B.10.296; Madison Hemings 1873)

Housing at Monticello:

On her return to Monticello in 1789, she may have lived in the stone house on Mulberry Row (present Weaver's Cottage), where her sister Critta Hemings was known to have lived. Thus, in 1793, she would have moved, as did Critta, into one of the three new, 12 by 14 foot, log cabins on Mulberry Row. (Jefferson to Thomas M. Randolph, 19 May 1793, B.26.65)

Some time between 1803 and 1807, she evidently moved into one of the "servant's rooms" in the South Dependencies, between the South Pavilion and the dairy. In 1851, while walking around Monticello, Jefferson's grandson Thomas J. Randolph pointed out to biographer Henry S. Randall "a smoke blackened and sooty room in one of the collonades, and informed me it was Sally Henings' [sic] room." (Randall 1868)

Nothing has been found in the documentary record to indicate that Sally Hemings ever lived in the Monticello house. A public perception that she either lived in the space over Jefferson's bed or used it for access to an upstairs room appears to derive from two recent novels. The space, used as a storage closet by 1815, varies in width from 2'6" to 2'9" (Jefferson referred to "the closet over my bed" in a letter to his daughter Martha, 4 Nov. 1815, FAM.411). According to architectural historians, who removed a modern staircase in 1979, the space was reached either by a ladder or a steep ladder-like stair.

Training and Occupation:

Circa 1784 to 1787, nursemaid-companion to Jefferson's younger daughter, Mary (her presence in 1787 at Eppington, rather than Monticello, as well as her selection to accompany Mary to Europe, suggests this).

1787 to 1797, lady's-maid to Martha and Mary (later Maria) Jefferson:

"My mother accompanied her [Mary Jefferson] as body servant" to France (Madison Hemings 1873)

"Mr. Jefferson took her to France to wait on Miss Polly." (Isaac Jefferson recollections, Bear.4)

For the return voyage from France to Virginia, Jefferson asked an agent to book accommodations on the vessel, "three master births...and births for a man and a w[o]man servant, the latter convenient to that of my daughters." (Jefferson to James Maurice, B.15.433)

Jefferson's reference to "Maria's maid" in Dec. 1799 appears to be to Sally Hemings. (Jefferson to John Wayles Eppes, 21 Dec. 1799, University of Virginia Library)

Jefferson's granddaughter Ellen Coolidge, in 1858, wrote that Sally Hemings "had accompanied Mr. Jefferson's younger daughter to Paris and was lady's maid to both sisters." (Coolidge 1858)

1790s to 1827, chambermaid and seamstress:

Sally Hemings's son Madison told a reporter in 1873 that "it was her duty, all her life which I can remember, up to the time of father's death, to take care of his chamber and wardrobe, look after us children and do such light work as sewing, &c." (Madison Hemings 1873)

Madison Hemings's neighbor and former Monticello slave Israel Jefferson told a reporter in 1873 that Sally Hemings "was employed as his [Jefferson's] chamber-maid." (Israel Jefferson 1873)

A Fredericktown newspaper reported that Sally Hemings "has a room to herself at Monticello in the character of sempstress to the family, if not as house-keeper." (Fredericktown *Herald*, reprinted in Richmond *Recorder*, 8 Dec. 1802)

Special Treatment:

Jefferson's records do not reveal any privileges accorded to Sally Hemings that distinguished her from others in her family. As part of Monticello's corps of domestic servants, almost all of whom were Hemingses, she received special dispensations that were not normally accorded to field workers. She, her mother, and her sisters were spared the backbreaking weeks of gathering in the wheat in June. Her clothing, like that of other household servants, was finer than the "uniform" distributed to other slaves. In 1794 and 1795, for instance, Sally Hemings and her sister Critta received Irish linen rather than the coarser "osnaburg" of the normal allotment and callimanco (a patterned glossy fabric) instead of the usual coarse woolen "knaps." The house servants received knitted cotton stockings instead of the ill-fitting woven stockings distributed to the rest of the enslaved workers. (FB.41, 49)

Madison Hemings recalled in 1873 that his mother had been "well used" at Monticello. Jefferson's grandson Thomas J. Randolph told biographer Henry S. Randall that Sally Hemings "was treated, dressed, etc., exactly like the rest." (Madison Hemings 1873; Randall 1868)

In 1796 and 1797, Edith and then Agnes Hern, both nine years old at the time, lived in Sally Hemings's house when her daughter Harriet was an infant. This has led at least one historian to suggest that these "baby sitters" were a unique special privilege. In several other cases, however, Jefferson provided such help for his house servants. (FB.50, 52; Jack McLaughlin, *Jefferson and Monticello: Biography of a Builder*, New York, 1988, p. 406)

One distinction accorded to Sally Hemings and to no other enslaved Monticello family was the freedom granted all of her children after the age of twenty-one.

Freedom:

Her son Madison told a newspaperman in 1873 that "shortly after" Jefferson's death he and his brother Eston, who both had been freed in Jefferson's will, took their mother to live in Charlottesville with them. Sally Hemings had not been freed in the will, yet she appeared with Madison Hemings as a free person of color in a special census in 1833 (and the census of 1830 also suggests she was considered free). In a superseded will of 1834, Jefferson's daughter Martha Randolph wrote that "to Betsy Hemmings, Sally & Wormley I wish my children to give their time. If liberated they would be obliged to leave the state of Virginia." This was probably a written reinforcement of a previous verbal arrangement. If it was made at Jefferson's recommendation before his death, no document has been found to confirm it. "Giving time" was a common method of informal emancipation that avoided the effects of the 1806 removal law requiring freed slaves to leave the state within a year. Sally Hemings would have been recognized as free in her local community but, without any legal "free papers," she could not have safely left the neighborhood where she was known. (Madison Hemings 1873; Stanton, "Monticello to Main Street," pp. 107-108; 1830 Albemarle County census; Martha Randolph will, 18 Apr. [1834], University of Virginia Library)

Died: 1835 (Madison Hemings 1873). Her place of burial is not known.

CHILD (b. 1790)

Testimony about the existence of a child born in Virginia soon after Sally Hemings's return from France is contradictory. Madison Hemings said this "child....lived but a short time." In 1802 James T. Callender wrote of a twelve-year-old child named Tom. The oral history of the Woodson family says Hemings's child born in 1790 lived to be Thomas C. Woodson (1790-1879). Although no documentation has yet been found to connect Woodson to Sally Hemings and Monticello, the longstanding oral history warrants inclusion of information about him here:

THOMAS C. WOODSON

Born: 1785-1790 (U.S. Censuses, 1840-1870 indicate a birth date range from 1785 to 1790; according to Woodson family tradition he was born in 1790, soon after Sally Hemings's return to Virginia from France).

Parents: Unknown. According to Woodson family tradition, he was the oldest child of Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings. There is no supporting documentary evidence for this, nor was there a genetic match between Woodson and Jefferson descendants.

Wife: Jemima (1782-1868) (tombstone, Jackson County, Ohio)

Children: Lewis (1806-1878); George (1808-1866); Delilah (b. 1810); Thomas (1812-1846); Jemima (b. 1813); Frances (b. 1815); James (1818-1881); John P. (1819-1853); William (1822-1866); Hannah G. (b. 1823); Sarah Jane (1825-1907) (WSB)

Descriptions:

1840 "I have never found a more intelligent, enterprising, farming family in the State of Ohio." (Extract from *The Philanthropist* reprinted in *The Colored American*, 31 Oct. 1840)

1891 "In this church [African Methodist Episcopal (AME) Church, Jackson County, Ohio, 1830s-1840s] is the family of the Woodsons, of whom the father is Thomas Woodson, and the mother, Jemima, who are remarkable for their piety, intelligence, and family government." (Daniel A. Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, Nashville, 1891, p. 310)

According to Beverly Gray, consultant to Monticello's Getting Word oral history project, unpublished eyewitness accounts from Ohio describe Thomas Woodson as tall and always well dressed, a man who remained aloof from most people in the area, but was very well respected.

Residences:

Before 1807, no documentary reference to Woodson has yet been found.

At least 1807 to 1820, with wife and children in Greenbrier County, Virginia (now West Virginia). (WSB.21, 125a,b; Greenbrier County Deed Book 4:110-111)

1821 to 1829, with his family in Chillicothe, Ross County, Ohio. (WSB.21)

1829 to his death, in a rural black community, of which he was one of the founders, in Milton Township, Jackson County, Ohio. (WSB.22, 28)

Occupation:

From 1829, he was a farmer, eventually owning over 400 acres and raising hogs, cattle, corn, and hay. According to an account in 1840 his was "acknowledged to be the best cultivated farm in Jackson county." ("From the Philanthropist," *The Colored American*, 31 Oct. 1840)

Woodson was the wealthiest of the farmers, most of them also former slaves from Virginia, in the Jackson County settlement. He had real estate worth \$6,750 in 1850 and \$11,000 in 1860. His son Lewis described the settlement, which consisted of twenty or thirty families, in 1838: "They have a church, day and Sabbath School of their own. The people of this settlement cut their harvests, roll their own logs, and raise their own houses, just as well as though they had been assisted by white friends. They find just as ready and as high market for their grain and cattle, as their white neighbors. They take the newspapers and read many useful books, and are making as rapid advancement in intelligence and refinement as any people in the county generally do. And when they travel out of their settlement, no colored people, let them reside where or among whom they may, are more respected, or treated with greater deference than they are." (Lewis Woodson, in *Colored American*, 28 July 1838; WSB.49-50)

Religion and Education:

Thomas and Jemima Woodson were early members of the Methodist church in Chillicothe. In 1821, the Woodsons and other black members left to form their own church under the leadership of the Rev. Richard Allen. This was the first African Methodist Episcopal (AME) church organized west of the Alleghany mountains. The Woodsons' sons Lewis, John P., and Thomas became AME ministers. (WSB.45-48)

Although Thomas Woodson was apparently illiterate (he signed his name to legal documents with a cross), his children achieved a high level of education. The school in Jackson Settlement was noted in 1840 as "the most forward" in the township. Four of his sons were school teachers; Lewis Woodson was a founding trustee of Wilberforce University. The youngest daughter Sarah graduated from Oberlin College and became the first female African-American teacher at the college level, when she taught at Wilberforce in 1858. (WSB.32b; 144-152)

Antislavery Activity:

The Woodson family was active in the Underground Railroad. According to local oral tradition, one son was beaten to death for not revealing the hiding place of a fugitive slave. Thomas Woodson attended state conventions for blacks and was local agent for a black Columbus newspaper. His oldest son Lewis fought against slavery in conventions and through newspaper articles; his views on separate black settlements and organizations led one historian to name him a contender for the title, "father of black nationalism."

(WSB. 125a, 132; Floyd J. Miller, "'The Father of Black Nationalism': Another Contender," *Civil War History*, 17, no. 4 [Dec. 1971], 310-319)

Death: 1875-1882, probably circa 1879. (Last appearance in records, 1875; surviving estate records 1882-1883; not found in 1880 census; WSB. 40-42, 141-141)

HARRIET HEMINGS I

Born: 5 Oct. 1795 (FB.31)

Parents: Sally Hemings and, most likely, Thomas Jefferson (FB.31)

Death: December 1797 ("Poor little Harriot...died a few days after you left us," Martha J. Randolph to TJ, 22 Jan. 1798, FAM.153)

BEVERLY HEMINGS

Name: Possibly William Beverly Hemings, the name given by his brother Madison to his third son.

Born: 1 Apr. 1798 (FB.57)

Parents: Sally Hemings and, most likely, Thomas Jefferson (FB.57; Madison Hemings 1873)

Spouse: "He married a white woman in Maryland....[Her] family were people in good circumstances." (Madison Hemings 1873)

Children: Daughter, only child; no living descendants are known. (Madison Hemings 1873)

Descriptions:

1858 Ellen Randolph Coolidge, Jefferson's granddaughter: "White enough to pass for white." (Coolidge 1858)

Residences: Monticello until 1822; Washington, DC, and possibly Maryland, afterward (FB.130; Madison Hemings 1873)

Occupation: Carpenter; musician

He is listed in the Farm Book as a "tradesman" in 1810 at the age of twelve. He may then have been working in the nailery and began his training as a woodworker two years later. He dressed timber for the coopers in 1819 and 1820, and was working with "the carpenters" in 1820. (FB.128; Edmund Bacon to TJ, 4 Sep. 1819, Massachusetts

Historical Society [MHi], 16 July 1820, University of Virginia Library; TJ to Bacon, 29 Nov. 1820, MHi)

In 1815, and probably other years, he worked in the wheat harvest; he was a gatherer/binder at the Lego farm in 1815. (FB.149)

In an unsigned note, one of Jefferson's granddaughters in 1819 or 1820 asks the addressee to come to Monticello to "dance after Beverley's music" at the South Pavilion ([Virginia Randolph?] to [Jane H. Randolph], undated, University of North Carolina: Trist Papers)

Status: He was not legally manumitted, but left Monticello in 1822, evidently with Jefferson's permission, and henceforth lived as a white man.

1822+ "Beverly. run away 22." ("Roll of negroes according to their ages," FB.130)

1858 Ellen Coolidge, Jefferson's granddaughter: "It was [Jefferson's] principle...to allow such of his slaves as were sufficiently white to pass for white men, to withdraw quietly from the plantation; it was called running away, but they were never reclaimed. I remember four instances of this, three young men and one girl, who walked away and staid away--their whereabouts was perfectly known but they were left to themselves--for they were white enough to pass for white." (Coolidge 1858)

1873 His brother, Madison Hemings: "We all became free agreeably to the treaty entered into by our parents before we were born....Beverly left Monticello and went to Washington as a white man." (Madison Hemings 1873)

Other: He apparently ran away from Monticello for a short period in the summer of 1820. (Edmund Bacon to TJ, 16 July 1820, University of Virginia Library)

Death: Unknown; Madison Hemings's 1873 reference to him suggests that he was still alive at the time. (Madison Hemings 1873)

DAUGHTER

Born: c. 7 Dec. 1799

Jefferson wrote the husband of his daughter Maria that "Maria's maid produced a daughter about a fortnight ago, and is doing well." The most likely candidate for "Maria's maid" still resident at Monticello, rather than with the Eppes, is Sally Hemings. (TJ to John Wayles Eppes, 21 Dec. 1799, University of Virginia Library)

Parents: Sally Hemings and, most likely, Thomas Jefferson

Name: Possibly Thenia, after Sally Hemings's sister Thenia (1767-1795)

A December 1799 meat ration list includes a Thenia living with Sally Hemings and her twenty-month-old son Beverly. TJ drew a line through her name, as he did with Jupiter and Ursula, who died within the next six months. Abraham and Doll's daughter Thenia is, however, missing from this list, so that she may have been living with Sally Hemings, as

did the eight-year-olds Edy and Aggy in 1795 and 1797. Since Doll's Thenia was only six in 1799, it seems unlikely she would have been separated from her parents and sent to live with Sally Hemings at such a young age.

HARRIET HEMINGS II

Born: May 1801 (FB.128)

Parents: Sally Hemings and, most likely, Thomas Jefferson (FB.128; Madison Hemings 1873)

Spouse: "A white man in good standing in Washington City" (Madison Hemings 1873)

Children: "She raised a family of children." None of her living descendants is known. (Madison Hemings 1873)

Descriptions:

1847 Isaac Jefferson, former Monticello slave: "Harriet, one of Sally's daughters, was very handsome." (Bear.4)

1858 Ellen Randolph Coolidge, Jefferson's granddaughter: "One girl [was] white enough to pass for white." (Coolidge 1858)

1862 Edmund Bacon, former Monticello overseer: "She was nearly as white as anybody and very beautiful." (Bear.102)

Residences: Monticello until 1822; Washington, DC, afterward (FB.130; Madison Hemings 1873)

Occupation: Textile worker.

1815 Listed as a wool spinner in the cloth "factory" (FB.152)

1862 Edmund Bacon: "From the time she was large enough, she always worked in the cotton factory. She never did any hard work." (Bear.102)

1873 Madison Hemings, her brother: Until the age of fourteen, "we were permitted to stay about the 'great house,' and only required to do such light work as going on errands. Harriet learned to spin and to weave in a little factory on the home plantation." (Madison Hemings 1873)

Status: She was not legally manumitted, but left Monticello in 1822, evidently with Jefferson's permission, and henceforth lived as a white woman.

- 1822+ "Harriet. Sally's run. 22." ("Roll of negroes according to their ages," FB. 130)
- 1858 Ellen Coolidge: "It was [Jefferson's] principle...to allow such of his slaves as were sufficiently white to pass for white men, to withdraw quietly from the plantation; it was called running away, but they were never reclaimed. I remember four instances of this, three young men and one girl, who walked away and staid away--their whereabouts was perfectly known but they were left to themselves--for they were white enough to pass for white." (Coolidge 1858)
- 1862 Edmund Bacon: "Mr. Jefferson...freed one girl some years before he died, and there was a great deal of talk about it....When she was nearly grown, by Mr. Jefferson's direction I paid her stage fare to Philadelphia and gave her fifty dollars." (Bear.102)
- 1873 Madison Hemings: "She thought it to her interest, on going to Washington, to assume the role of a white woman, and by her dress and conduct as such I am not aware that her identity as Harriet Hemings of Monticello has ever been discovered." (Madison Hemings 1873)
- Death:** Unknown. In 1873, her brother Madison Hemings had "not heard from her for ten years." (Madison Hemings 1873)

MADISON HEMINGS

Name: Although he always used only the single given name, his full name may have been James Madison Hemings, the name of his fourth son.

"As to myself, I was named Madison by the wife of James Madison, who...happened to be at Monticello at the time of my birth, and begged the privilege of naming me, promising my mother a fine present for the honor." (Madison Hemings 1873)

Born: 19 Jan. 1805 (FB.128; Madison Hemings 1873)

Parents: Sally Hemings and, most likely, Thomas Jefferson (FB.128; Madison Hemings 1873)

Spouse: Mary Hughes McCoy, granddaughter of Stephen and Chana Hughes, a plantation owner and his slave, whom he freed. The marriage took place in Charlottesville, 21 Nov. 1831. Mary McCoy Hemings died between 1873 and 1877 (marriage license, Albemarle County Clerk's Office; Madison Hemings 1873; Madison Hemings estate records, Ross County, Ohio)

Children: Son (d. infant); Sarah Hemings Byrd (1835-1884); Thomas Eston Hemings (1838-1863); Harriet Hemings Butler Spears (1839-1925); Mary Ann Hemings Johnson (1843-1921); Catherine Jane Hemings Hale (1844-); William Beverly Hemings (1847-1910); James Madison Hemings (1849-); Julia A. Hemings (1851-1867); Ellen Wayles Hemings Roberts (1856-1940)

Living descendants of his daughters Sarah, Harriet, and Ellen are known.

Descriptions:

1831. "5:7 3/8 Inches high light complexion no scars or marks perceivable." (Albemarle County Minute Book, 1830-1831, p. 123, 6 Sep. 1831)

1873 March. S. F. Wetmore, journalist: "He is an intelligent man, and understands himself well. If he had been educated and given a chance in the world he would have shone out as a star of the first magnitude....Mr. Hemings is five feet ten inches in height, sparely made, with sandy complexion and a mild gray eye." (Malone and Hochman, pp. 526-527)

1873 March. Thomas Jefferson "was a much smarter man physically, even at that age [83], than I am [68]." (Madison Hemings 1873)

1990s. According to Beverly Gray (Chillicothe, Ohio), a white resident of Ross County remembers his great-uncle talking about Madison Hemings and describing him as the "junior president." "His word was his bond," he said.

Residences:

Birth to 1827. Monticello (with some absences at Poplar Forest, working on the house there).

1827 to c1830. With his mother and brother Eston, in a rented house in Charlottesville. (Madison Hemings 1873)

c1830 to 1836. With his mother, wife and children, and--until 1832--his brother Eston, in a house owned jointly with his brother, on West Main Street, Charlottesville (Albemarle County Deed Book, 29: 276-277; 34: 137-138; 1833 special census)

1836 to c. 1841. With his wife and children, in Pebble Township, Pike County, Ohio (Madison Hemings 1873)

c1841 to 1877, Pee Pee Hills community, Ross County, Ohio. From 1857 to 1859, he owned 25 acres there. From 1865, he owned his own 66-acre farm. (Ross County Deed Book, 59: 389-390, 63: 624, 68: 562-563; Hemings estate records, Ross County)

Occupation: House servant; carpenter, joiner, and wheelwright; farmer

As a child he worked in the Monticello house, going on errands and possibly acting as waiter and porter. (Madison Hemings 1873)

His training as a woodworker began at age fourteen, with his uncle John Hemings. His known activities include helping John Hemings install Monticello's tin roof (spring 1825) and working on the Poplar Forest roof and other tasks (summer 1825). (Madison Hemings 1873; TJ to F. W. Eppes, Apr. 1825, FAM.453)

After Jefferson's death, he did work for Jefferson's grandsons Thomas J. and Benjamin F. Randolph and for a Mrs. Taylor. Work for some of his unknown employers probably took him periodically away from Charlottesville. (Hemings to Thomas J. Randolph, 15 Jan. 1833, ViU)

After his arrival in Ohio in 1836, he worked at his trade "on and off" and was involved in the construction of three buildings in Waverly, now the Pike County seat: Bissell Port, the Pike County *Republican* building, and a hotel (now the Emmitt House). The two latter structures still stand. The inventory of his estate at the time of his death--which included a large variety of planes and chisels as well as wagon spokes--reveals that

he was still practicing his woodworking trade (Madison Hemings 1873; Hemings estate records, Ross County)

His estate records indicate that he actively farmed his 66 acres. The inventory of his estate included a black mare, seven hogs, plows, and cultivator. (Hemings estate records, Ross County)

Religion and Education:

Nothing is known about Madison Hemings's religious life. It is possible he and his wife were members of the Pee Pee Hills (now Eden Baptist) Church near their farm. His daughter Sarah is buried in the Eden Baptist graveyard.

By his own account, he "learned to read by inducing the white children to teach me the letters and something more; what else I know of books I have picked up here and there, till now I can read and write." Three relevant documents survive: his marriage license (1831), bearing his signature; an 1833 letter, written apparently by an amanuensis, with a quite different signature;

and a brief signed promissory note from 1870. (Madison Hemings 1873; Hemings to Thomas J. Randolph, 15 Jan. 1833, ViU; note to Giles Roberts, 2 Dec. 1870, Hemings estate records)

Status:

Born a slave; freed by Jefferson's will at age twenty-one, an age he had reached by Jefferson's death; at Jefferson's request, the Virginia legislature passed an act allowing Madison and Eston Hemings, and three other relatives mentioned in the will, to remain in the state despite the 1806 removal law. (Jefferson will, in Bear.122; *Acts of Assembly* [Richmond, 1826], p. 127)

1830 census, Charlottesville, white; 1833 special census, Charlottesville, mulatto; 1840, 1850, 1860, 1870 Ohio censuses, mulatto.

Other:

He and his brother Eston sold 100 cabbages to Jefferson in December 1824. (MB.1408)

Isaac Jefferson recalled that Madison "learned to be a great fiddler" and was in Petersburg, VA, twice (Bear.4). He is more plausibly referring to Eston Hemings.

Death: 28 Nov. 1877; burial site possibly in the Barnett-Williams cemetery near his Ross County residence, where daughter Julia and grandmother-in-law Chana Hughes are buried.

ESTON HEMINGS

Name: Possibly Thomas Eston Hemings, the name of his brother Madison's second son. Thomas Jefferson's cousin Thomas Eston Randolph and his family were neighbors and close friends of the family of Jefferson's daughter Martha Randolph.

Birth: 21 May 1808 (FB.128)

Parents: Sally Hemings and, most likely, Thomas Jefferson (FB.128; Madison Hemings 1873)

Spouse: Julia Ann Isaacs (1814-1889), daughter of Jewish merchant David Isaacs and Ann (Nancy) West, a free woman of color. The marriage took place in Charlottesville, 14 June 1832. (Albemarle County marriage bond, 1832; Forest Hill Cemetery, Madison, WI; Stanton, "Monticello to Main Street," pp. 105-108)

Children: John Wayles Jefferson (1835-1892); Anna W. Jefferson Pearson (1836-1866); Beverly Jefferson (1838-1908) (Forest Hill Cemetery; 1850 Ross County, Ohio, census)

Descriptions:

- 1832 "6 feet one inch high, Bright Mulatto - no scars or marks." (Albemarle County Minute Book, 1832-1843, p. 12)
- 1887 Ohio journalist: "Eston Hemings, the Ben Hunter of that day, was a fine looking man, very slightly colored, of large size." (*Chillicothe Leader*, 26 Jan. 1887)
- 1901 Ohio journalist: "A remarkably fine looking colored man....Eston Hemings was of a light bronze color, a little over six feet tall, well proportioned, very erect and dignified; his nearly straight hair showed a tint of auburn, and his face, indistinct suggestion of freckles. Quiet, unobtrusive, polite and decidedly intelligent, he was soon very well and favorably known to all classes of our citizens, for his personal appearance and gentlemanly manners attracted everybody's attention to him." (*Daily Scioto Gazette*, 1 Aug. 1902)

Residences:

- Birth to 1827.* Monticello (FB.passim)
- 1827 to c1830.* With his mother and brother Madison, in a rented house in Charlottesville (Madison Hemings 1873)
- c1830 to 1832.* With his mother and brother, in a purchased house on West Main Street, Charlottesville. (Albemarle County Deed Book, 29.276-277)
- 1832 to 1837.* With his wife and children, in a family-owned and built house on East Main Street, Charlottesville (Stanton, "Monticello to Main Street," p. 107-108, 112-113)
- 1839 to 1852.* With his wife and children, in a house on Paint Street, Chillicothe, Ohio, purchased for \$1,000. (Ross County Deed Book, 36: 168-169; 53: 179-180)

Occupation: Carpenter and cabinetmaker; musician.

Trained in woodworking at Monticello by his uncle John Hemings, he worked in the ten years after his emancipation as a carpenter and also probably as a musician. In the 1833 special census, he is listed as a carpenter; in the same year, he made a violin case for the University of Virginia (1833 special census; receipt, Proctor's papers, University of Virginia, 11 June 1833)

During his residence in Ohio, he was a professional musician, listed as such in the 1850 census. He was a very successful dance band leader, recalled as "a master of the violin, and an accomplished 'caller' of dances," who "always officiated at the 'swell'

entertainments of Chillicothe," and was in demand all across southern Ohio. (Ross County census, 1850; *Daily Scioto Gazette*, 1 Aug. 1902; *Chillicothe Leader*, 26 Jan. 1887; 1850 Ross County, Ohio, census)

In Madison, Wisconsin, he worked as a cabinetmaker. (Madison Directory, 1855)

Education:

Nothing is known about his education. Several documents bearing his signature survive, from the 1830s. No other documents in his hand have been found. (his marriage license, 1832; receipt, Proctor's papers, 1833; marriage license of Jerman Evans and Agnes Isaacs, 20 Oct. 1836, Albemarle County)

Status:

Born a slave; bequeathed freedom at age twenty-one by Jefferson's will, but given "the remainder of his time" at age nineteen by Jefferson's executors; at Jefferson's request, the Virginia legislature passed an act allowing Madison and Eston Hemings, and three other relatives mentioned in the will, to remain in the state despite the 1806 removal law. (Jefferson will, in Bear.122; Madison Hemings 1873; *Acts of Assembly* [Richmond, 1826], p. 127)

1830 census, Charlottesville, white; 1833 special census, Charlottesville, mulatto; 1840, 1850 Ohio censuses, mulatto.

Other:

He and his brother Madison sold 100 cabbages to Jefferson in December 1824. (MB.1408)

Isaac Jefferson recalled that Madison Hemings "learned to be a great fiddler" and was in Petersburg, VA, twice (Bear.4). He is more plausibly referring to Eston Hemings.

In 1837, he helped carry his father-in-law's coffin to Richmond for burial and attended two auctions, purchasing bowls and silver spoons. (Stanton, "Monticello to Main Street," p. 113)

Death: 3 Jan. 1856; burial in Forest Hill Cemetery, Madison, Wisconsin. (tombstone)

Sources:

- 1833 special census Ervin L. Jordan, Jr., "'A Just and True Account': Two 1833 Parish Censuses of Albemarle County Free Blacks," *Magazine of Albemarle County History* 53 (1995), pp. 114-139
- B Julian P. Boyd et al., eds., *The Papers of Thomas Jefferson* (Princeton, 1950--)
- Bear James A. Bear, Jr., ed., *Jefferson at Monticello* (Charlottesville, 1967)
- Brodie 1976 Fawn M. Brodie, "Thomas Jefferson's Unknown Grandchildren: A Study in Historical Silence," *American Heritage* 27 (Oct. 1976), pp. 23-33, 94-99
- Coolidge 1858 Ellen Coolidge to Joseph Coolidge, 24 Oct. 1858, in Gordon-Reed, pp. 258-260
- FAM Edwin M. Betts and James A. Bear, Jr., eds. *The Family Letters of Thomas Jefferson* (Columbia, Missouri, 1966)
- FB Facsimile pages of Edwin M. Betts, ed., *Thomas Jefferson's Farm Book* (Princeton, 1953)
- Gordon-Reed Annette Gordon-Reed, *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings: An American Controversy* (Charlottesville, 1997)
- Israel Jefferson 1873 Israel Jefferson recollections, *Pike County [Ohio] Republican*, 25 Dec. 1873, in Gordon-Reed, pp. 249-253
- Madison Hemings 1873 Madison Hemings recollections, *Pike County Republican*, 13 Mch. 1873, in Gordon-Reed, pp. 245-248
- MB James A. Bear, Jr., and Lucia C. Stanton, eds., *Thomas Jefferson's Memorandum Books* (Princeton, 1997)
- Randall 1868 Henry S. Randall to James Parton, 1 June 1868, in Gordon-Reed, pp. 254-257
- Stanton, "Monticello to Main Street" Lucia C. Stanton, "Monticello to Main Street: The Hemings Family and Charlottesville," *Magazine of Albemarle County History* 55 (1997), pp. 94-126
- WSB Minnie Shumate Woodson, *The Woodson Source Book* (Washington, 1980, with revisions 1982)

Appendix I

Statistical study of the relationship between Thomas Jefferson's presence at Monticello and Sally Hemings's conceptions

This article by Monticello Director of Archaeology Fraser D. Neiman is not available as part of this .pdf version of the report. It is available as part of the current edition of the *William and Mary Quarterly*, expected to be released in January 2000.

Appendix J

The Possible Paternity of Other Jeffersons A Summary of Research

A range of primary and secondary material was used to inform the conclusions of the committee. The principal sources are:

- Jefferson's unpublished correspondence, in microfilm editions of Library of Congress, Massachusetts Historical Society, University of Virginia, and other repositories
- Jefferson's "Summary Journal of Letters"
- Field Jefferson and Randolph Jefferson files in the Monticello Research Library, which contain a great deal of genealogical information
- Evelyn and Herbert Barger, compilers, "The Jefferson Family of Virginia," (1987; revised 1990)
- "Memoirs of a Monticello Slave," in James A. Bear, Jr., ed., *Jefferson at Monticello* (Charlottesville, 1967)
- F. A. Battey, *History of Todd County, Kentucky* (1884)
- Landon C. Bell, *The Old Free State: A Contribution to the History of Lunenburg County and Southside Virginia*
- Bernard Mayo, ed., *Thomas Jefferson and His Unknown Brother* (1981), which contains the surviving correspondence between the two brothers.

Two staff reports were produced using some of the above sources: Josh Rothman, "Preliminary Assessment of Jefferson-Male Alternatives to Thomas Jefferson's Fathering of Sally Hemings's Children," February 1999, and Camille Wells, "Contemporary Male Relatives of Thomas Jefferson," February 1999.

From this research it was determined that, other than Thomas Jefferson, twenty-five adult male descendants of his father Peter (1707-1757) and his uncle Field (1702-1765) lived in Virginia during the 1794-1807 period of Sally Hemings's pregnancies (**see attached family tree**):

- His brother Randolph Jefferson (1755-1815) and five of his sons
- His first cousin John Robertson Jefferson (1743-1809) and six of his sons
- Seven sons of Peter Field Jefferson (1735-1794), his first cousin
- Five sons of George Jefferson (1739-1780), his first cousin

Of the nineteen descendants of Field Jefferson, all but two (George Jefferson, Jr., and John Garland Jefferson) lived over a hundred miles from Monticello in Southside Virginia and make no appearance in Thomas Jefferson's correspondence, accounts, or family recollections. These two men, plus Randolph Jefferson and his sons, were studied in more detail.

George Jefferson, Jr. (1766-1812)

Commission merchant in Richmond (seventy miles from Monticello) from at least 1797 to 1812. Acted as Thomas Jefferson's commission agent. May have occasionally visited Monticello, although no reference to such visits has yet been found.

John Garland Jefferson (d. 1815)

Pursued his studies in the Monticello neighborhood, with Thomas Jefferson's support, from June 1790 to some time in 1791, with occasional visits in 1792 and 1793. Married in 1800. Attorney in Amelia County (seventy miles from Monticello) from 1801.

Randolph Jefferson (1755-1815)

Lived on his plantation, Snowden, about twenty miles south of Monticello in Buckingham County. First married in 1781; widowed some time between 1792 and 1807; remarried circa 1808.

A former Monticello slave, Isaac Jefferson, recalled in 1847 that Randolph Jefferson "used to come out among black people, play the fiddle and dance half the night." Since Isaac Jefferson left Monticello in 1797, his reference probably predates that year, and most likely refers to the 1780s, the period that is the subject of the majority of his recollections.

There is no surviving correspondence between the brothers from 1792 to 1807. Thomas Jefferson's two surviving letters of 1807, which express the hope that his brother would visit Monticello during his spring and late summer vacations, suggest that similar invitations were extended in the preceding years. The correspondence also suggests that Randolph Jefferson may not always have acted on these invitations. In his post-1807 letters, ill health, the poor state of the roads, and other circumstances were often cited as reasons to postpone his Monticello visits. In fact, his only recorded Monticello visits in this period were made on his own business and not at his brother's invitation.

Only four recorded visits to Monticello (in September 1802, September 1805, May 1808, and sometime in 1814) are known, none related to Sally Hemings's conceptions. In August 1807, a probable conception time for Eston Hemings, Thomas Jefferson wrote his brother that "we shall be happy to see you also" at Monticello, where Randolph's twin sister, Anna Marks, was then visiting. A search of visitors' accounts, memorandum books, and Jefferson's published and unpublished correspondence provided no indication that Randolph did, in fact, come at this time. A similar search was made of the probable conception time for Madison Hemings, without finding reference to a Randolph Jefferson visit.

Randolph Jefferson's Sons

Isham Randolph Jefferson (1781-1852)

An 1884 book on Todd County, Kentucky, says that he was "reared" at Monticello; no reference to him, however, has yet been found in Thomas Jefferson's papers.

Thomas Jefferson, Jr. (1783-1876)

Resident at Monticello for extended periods of schooling in 1799 and 1800, and possibly 1801.

Field Jefferson (c1785?-1808+)

No documentary references found, other than Randolph Jefferson's 1808 will.

Robert Lewis Jefferson (c1787?-1808+)

Carried a letter to Monticello in July or August 1807; dated July 9, it was not received by Thomas Jefferson, who arrived at Monticello August 4, until August 8. No further information found.

James Lilburne Jefferson (c1789?-1816+)

No references found until 1813, when Jefferson invited him to come study at Monticello.

CONCLUSIONS:

Since there is no indication of their presence at Monticello in the 1794 to 1807 period, Field Jefferson's grandsons George Jefferson and John Garland Jefferson are unlikely candidates for fatherhood. Two of Randolph Jefferson's sons (Thomas Jefferson, Jr., and Robert Lewis Jefferson) may well have been at Monticello in the 1800 and 1807 conception periods, but they and their brothers are also unlikely fathers because of their youth and very intermittent presence. As mentioned elsewhere, no one familiar with Monticello suggested that Sally Hemings was promiscuous or that her children had multiple fathers.

A stronger case can be made for Randolph Jefferson, who may have had a more sustained presence at Monticello. He was probably encouraged to visit Monticello when Thomas Jefferson was in residence on his vacations from public life. The Isaac Jefferson reference indicates social interaction with the Monticello slaves. The dates of Randolph's widowhood also may coincide with Sally Hemings's childbearing years (the date of the death of his first wife is not certainly known).

On the other hand, no documented Randolph Jefferson visits at the time of the conception of Sally Hemings's six known children have been found. Also, it is known that, at least once in the relevant period, Randolph Jefferson visited the Monticello neighborhood in his brother's absence; none of Sally Hemings's known children were conceived in Thomas Jefferson's absence. As stated above, Isaac Jefferson's observation most likely relates to the period of Randolph Jefferson's youth.

Furthermore, there are no known references (prior to the 1998 DNA results) to Randolph Jefferson as a possible father of Sally Hemings's children. If he was a frequent visitor to Monticello, as well as a known figure in the slave quarters, it would have been more logical for Thomas Jefferson Randolph to attribute to Randolph Jefferson the striking resemblance of Sally Hemings's children to his brother Thomas. Instead, he cited Jefferson's nephews Peter and Samuel Carr, whose connection to Eston Hemings has been ruled out by genetic testing.

For these reasons, as well as the substantial evidence linking Thomas Jefferson to Sally Hemings cited elsewhere in this report, it is very unlikely that Randolph Jefferson or any Jefferson other than Thomas Jefferson was the father of her children.

Appendix K

Assessment of Thomas C. Woodson's Connection to Sally Hemings

Thomas C. Woodson (c. 1790-c. 1879) was an African American whose first known appearance in the documentary record is in a deed of 1807 in Greenbrier County, Virginia (now West Virginia). Shortly after 1820, he left Virginia for Ohio, where he lived for some years in Chillicothe and afterward in nearby Jackson County, where he was a very successful farmer. He and his wife Jemima raised a family of eleven children, many of whom became ministers or educators.

The strongest evidence supporting Thomas C. Woodson's connection to Monticello is the enduring oral history in the Woodson family. In the 1970s descendants of Woodson, through five of his children, renewed contact with each other for the first time in several generations. They learned that they preserved a family history that was almost identical in its basic statements, including that Thomas Woodson was the son of Thomas Jefferson and was sent away from Monticello at some point in his boyhood. Additional elements of the story, not in all versions, are: that Woodson's mother was Jefferson's wife's half-sister, that he was sent from Monticello to a farm belonging to a Woodson (John Woodson is the name that appears in the family stories), and that he took Woodson's name (Minnie Woodson, *The Sable Curtain*, Washington, 1987, appendix).

Two documentary references have been found supporting the existence of a child of Sally Hemings born about 1790 and named Tom, or Thomas. James T. Callender (1802) made several references to a son of Sally Hemings named Tom, aged about twelve, in his articles in the *Richmond Recorder*. Since Callender corrected aspects of his story after first publishing it, he evidently heard from those who questioned the accuracy of some of his details. There is no indication that anyone came forward to deny the existence of an oldest son of Sally Hemings named Tom.

"The name of her eldest son is TOM. His features are said to bear a striking although sable resemblance to those of the president himself. The boy is ten or twelve years of age....We hear that our young MULLATO [sic] PRESIDENT begins to give himself a great number of airs of importance in Charlottesville, and the neighbourhood." (September 1, 1802)

[Referring to errors in an account in the *Lynchburg Gazette*]: "One of these bulls is that our little mulatto president, the fellow TOM, went to France along with his mother. We have some small reasons for thinking that TOM did not exist, at the time of the French embassy. He is not *big enough*, at least our correspondent thinks so, to have been in existence fifteen or sixteen years ago. Our information goes to twelve or thirteen years." (November 3, 1802)

The other reference is in a letter of a Georgia Federalist, Thomas Gibbons, to a fellow Federalist in 1802. Gibbons referred to "his [Jefferson's] children, to wit, Tom, Beverly and Harriot...tho I never saw any one of them" (December 20, 1802, Clements Library, University of Michigan).

No document has yet been found to link Thomas C. Woodson with Monticello, Sally Hemings, or Thomas Jefferson. A Woodson family historian, the late Minnie S. Woodson, uncovered records that persuasively supported many elements of the Woodson family oral history. She connected Woodson, through his wife Jemima, to the Woodsons of Goochland and Cumberland County, the family of Thomas Jefferson's maternal aunt.

Documentary links to Monticello, however, have not been found. There is no known reference to a child of Sally Hemings born before 1795 in Jefferson's papers. Jefferson kept no Farm Book records between 1783 and 1794, so a child who died in infancy could have existed without being recorded. If a child born in 1790 survived infancy, its absence from the Farm Book in 1794 and succeeding years is hard to explain. The presence of the names and birthdates of Sally Hemings's children Harriet I, Beverly, Harriet II, Madison, and Eston in the Farm Book seems to argue against intentional concealment on Jefferson's part. While absence from the Farm Book could be explained by the child's absence from Monticello, this would be unusual for a child as young as four. There is as yet no plausible explanation for Jefferson's treating one child entirely differently from the others in his record keeping.

The testimony of Sally Hemings's known son Madison is in conflict with the identity of Thomas Woodson as her son. In 1873 Madison Hemings told an Ohio newspaperman that, "soon after" Jefferson, his daughters, and James and Sally Hemings returned to Virginia at the end of 1789, Sally Hemings "gave birth to a child, of whom Thomas Jefferson was the father. It lived but a short time." He made no reference in his account to Thomas C. Woodson, who lived at the time only thirty miles away in an adjacent county. Again, intentional concealment does not seem to be his motive for failing to mention such a brother, since he referred to two of his siblings (Harriet and Beverly) who were then passing for white.

In 1805, Thomas Turner, described as a Virginian, "a gentleman of very respectable character," named Beverly Hemings as Sally Hemings's oldest child. He was a close acquaintance of David Meade Randolph, whose wife was a sister of Jefferson's son-in-law Thomas Mann Randolph. Turner wrote in a May 31 letter to the *Boston Repertory* that Jefferson and "black, (or rather mulatto) Sally...have cohabited for many years, and the fruit of the connexion abundantly exists in proof of the fact....The eldest son (called Beverly,) is well known to many."

If Thomas C. Woodson was Sally Hemings's son born in 1790, he would have been a father at sixteen and a landowner at seventeen; his wife would have been eight years older than he. While this is not necessarily impossible, it would have been highly unusual.

The 1998 DNA study indicates that Thomas C. Woodson was not Thomas Jefferson's son. Madison Hemings's statement and the absence of any information linking Woodson to Monticello make it unlikely that he was the son of Sally Hemings. Based on all the information available to us at this time, the committee cannot establish that Thomas C. Woodson was the child of Sally Hemings—despite a compelling oral tradition that almost certainly dates to Woodson's lifetime.